



Etta Armstrong <etta.armstrong@lacity.org>

---

## Fwd: Upload docs to CF11-0923

2 messages

---

Sharon Gin <sharon.gin@lacity.org>  
To: Etta Armstrong <etta.armstrong@lacity.org>

Tue, Jun 18, 2013 at 12:14 PM

----- Forwarded message -----

From: **Isabel Rojas-Williams** <iwilliams@muralconservancy.org>  
Date: Sat, Jun 15, 2013 at 8:45 PM  
Subject: Upload docs to CF11-0923  
To: Sharon Gin <sharon.gin@lacity.org>

Sharon,

Kindly upload the following documents (click twice) in the council file for the item CF11-0923? The attachment includes:

1. Willie Herrón's brief about the meeting among Councilmember Englander, Willie Herrón (MCLA), and Isabel Rojas-Williams (MCLA), on 3/29/13
2. MCLA's position on **Mural Ordinance Single Unit Residence Provision** by MCLA's president Bill Lasarow and MCLA's executive director Isabel Rojas-Williams.
3. MCLA's signed petition gathered at MCLA's "Mural Ordinance Update" by CM Ed Reyes on 6/13/13 at Avenue 50 Studio in Highland Park. The petitions requests removal of: "No new Original Art Mural shall be placed on a single family residence," B.7 from SEC.22.119. (page B-6).

Warmly,  
Isabel

Isabel Rojas-Williams  
Executive Director  
Mural Conservancy of Los Angeles (MCLA)  
iwilliams@muralconservancy.org  
155 W. Washington Blvd., Suite G-1, Los Angeles, CA 90015  
Office: 213-291-6900 | Fax: 213-291-9664 | Cell: 626-278-0761

Isabel Rojas-Williams  
Executive Director  
Mural Conservancy of Los Angeles (MCLA)  
iwilliams@muralconservancy.org  
155 W. Washington Blvd., Suite G-1, Los Angeles, CA 90015  
Office: 213-291-6900 | Fax:213-291-9664 | Cell: 626-278-0761

---

 **MCLA R1 petition and position.pdf**  
24115K

---

**Sharon Gin** <sharon.gin@lacity.org>  
To: Etta Armstrong <etta.armstrong@lacity.org>

Tue, Jun 18, 2013 at 12:15 PM

[Quoted text hidden]

---

 **MCLA R1 petition and position.pdf**  
24115K

# Letter Regarding Meeting with 12th District Councilmember, Mitchell Englander

March 29, 2013

To: The Mural Conservancy of Los Angeles (MCLA), Central City  
Action Committee,

United Painters and Public Artist, Mictlan Murals, Venice  
Arts Council, Tanner

Blackman

From: William F. Herron III

Re: Meeting with 12th District Councilmember, Mitchell Englander,  
regarding

Proposed Mural Ordinance from 01.15.13

Dear Associates,

On Tuesday, March 27, 2013, at 3pm, a meeting with  
Councilmember Mitchell Englander was arranged by  
executive director, Isabel Rojas-Williams of MCLA to discuss

the 01.15.13 proposed Mural Ordinance. Attending with Englander was Deputy Phyllis Winger, 12<sup>th</sup> District Chief Planning and Land Use, Isabel Rojas-Williams, Mural Conservancy of Los Angeles and William F Herron, Director/Co-Founder of Conservancy of Urban Art.

Mrs. Rojas-Williams and I, William F. Herron III raised the following concerns:

1. If decorative art murals (not defined by content) on exterior walls of a single family unit or zone become illegal in all 15 Districts, the following and existing walls will have to be painted out erased or removed by property owner (@ owner's expense), if property owner does not comply after a city citation is served (additional work for city employees) city graffiti abatement units will have to bear the extra work load @ tax payer's expense.

a. All existing fences, low walls, surrounding property line walls, alleyways, front court yards and entry's, car ports, garage doors and retainer walls with decorative art murals, vines and community beautification graffiti deterrent images or designs.

b. All walls with existing decorative art murals not grandfathered, vintage or in registered status.

c. All existing walls with decorative art mural finishes including all faux finishes, all tile borders, stone and sculpted rock wall reliefs, wall fountains and wall garden décor, venetian wall plaster or stucco finishes, decorative wall ageing and all wall trompe l'oeil .

2. The annual budgets for the 15 districts will have to

increase in order to implement the removal of a, b, c and the removal of graffiti and vandalism that will be provoked following the decorative art mural removals, in particular, walls with easy street access will attract additional unwanted vandal graffiti.

In conclusion, in order to avoid increasing taxes and in the immediate future, saving millions in tax payer dollars, Mrs. Rojas-Williams and I recommended allowing decorative wall murals on a single family unit or zone, classifying existing decorative wall murals as Vintage (for Grandfathering status), and exempting them from a registration fee. Also, upon the effective date of the new mural ordinance, all new decorative wall murals will have to comply with the new regulations, registration, and fees.

William F. Herron III

Conservancy of Urban Art

Mural Graffiti Abatement Technician

June 13<sup>th</sup>, 2013



**MCLA on Mural Ordinance  
Single Unit Residence Provision**

The constitutional rights of private property and freedom of speech and expression are properly upheld by the proposed Art Mural Ordinance as written, and the right of objection and redress on the part of individuals and local communities are preserved.

Indeed, prior to its January revision to eliminate a restriction on residential properties based on the number of units, the draft ordinance was on a track towards constitutional self-destruction based on real history. Commercial billboard companies successfully sued the City a decade ago on essentially these grounds, resulting the creation of new murals essentially grinding to a halt. Among other considerations, MCLA supports an ordinance that is crafted so as withstand such Constitutional challenges and is already on record as opposing one that invites being overturned by the courts.

The Fifth Amendment's "Just Takings" clause broadly protects citizens' private property from seizure by the government without "just compensation." It is not the private use of private property that is subject to the careful and limited use of regulation, it is the public use of private property.

In the case of a dispute between two residential property owners, is it the homeowner's right to modify their property or their neighbor's wish to prevent such modification that should hold sway? The long established right of local government to establish specific zoning regulations suggests that there are limits to the former; but the desire by the latter to impose either individual case or categorical restrictions based on personal taste or general speculation as to potential problems is insufficient to pass a Constitutional smell test. This is the so-called right of "sole dominion" that is long recognized as the basis by which we may exclude others, even neighbors, from imposing their will upon how we enjoy our property.

It is one thing for neighbors to air and negotiate potential differences of taste and opinion through free and open discussion; the option to resort to the courts to resolve disputes is always going to be there. The burden of proof is clearly NOT on the property owner but on the party objecting to how they use their own property. It is another thing entirely to call upon the government to categorically restrict the free use of private property so as, in this instance, to incidentally eliminate the vast majority of cases in which the embellishment of Art Murals is non-controversial or welcome. To mandate that is to shift the burden of proof onto the property owner and, more, to simply deny the property owner that discretionary right.

The fear of illegal activity by criminal gangs that has been expressed is frivolous. Permitting property owners to embellish their own property with Art Murals by ordinance in fact safeguards all of us from exactly such activity. MCLA stands firmly against graffiti vandalism, often perpetrated against legitimate public art, and the draft ordinance provides precisely the tools needed to combat such abuse. When there is genuine MIS-use, and the element of risk is introduced, if there might be physical damage done to a neighbor's property, the new ordinance offers a firm foundation to redress such legitimate grievance.

MCLA therefore calls upon the city to stand by the present language of the ordinance on this basis alone. But it is not the only compelling foundation.

The First Amendment's provision that "Congress shall make no law ... abridging the freedom of speech ..." may be our most fundamental right. To render it illegal for property owners to add Art Murals to their own property eliminates this basic right for both the property owner and the artist whom they wish to commission. The same point made already applies even more emphatically in the context of the First Amendment. The new ordinance does not eliminate or even restrict the rights of neighbors to seek to negotiate or redress a potential grievance; while to revise it to categorically eliminate Art Murals from single-family residences is to state that the First Amendment is not applicable in such a case. The same implications as have been stated follow, but in bold face and with capital letters.

MCLA recognizes that some individuals may not like Art Murals in some cases or perhaps ever. As a public advocate for the preservation and documentation of public Art Murals MCLA does not share this hostility, and for the most part we do not even understand it (that feeling may be mutual), but we stand by the right of these people to their opinions. The new Art Mural ordinance does not abrogate let alone ban the rights of these citizens, nor of specific neighborhoods to exercise long established rights to impose local regulations. But for any individual or group to impose their own preferences and fears, real or imagined, on the many citizens who love public Art Murals and benefit from their creation and presence in Los Angeles is morally wrong and flies in the face of our most fundamental laws and traditions.

Bill Lasarow  
ArtScene / Visual Art Source  
(213) 482-4724  
[artscene@artscenecal.com](mailto:artscene@artscenecal.com) / [billl@visualartsource.com](mailto:billl@visualartsource.com)  
<http://artscenecal.com> / <http://www.visualartsource.com>  
<http://www.artscenevisualradio.com>

Isabel Rojas-Williams  
Executive Director  
Mural Conservancy of Los Angeles (MCLA)  
(213)291-6900  
Mural Conservancy of Los Angeles (MCLA)  
[iwilliams@muralconservancy.org](mailto:iwilliams@muralconservancy.org)



PETITION

To The Los Angeles City Council:

CF 11-0923 / MURAL ORDINANCE

WE the undersigned petition the City Council of Los Angeles as follows:

Mural Ordinance CF 11-0923: remove "No new Original Art Mural shall be placed on a single family residence,"B.7 from SEC.22.119. (page B-6) to allow murals on single family residences.

NAME	ADDRESS	EMAIL	PHONE	SIGNATURE
Kristy Sandoval	Arleta Ca 91331 13656 Remington St.	kristysan@gmail.com	818-349-5164	
Baudelio Ibarra	24802 Baltimore St LA CA 90042			
Will Herron III	1550 McGilvrey Ave LA CA 90063	WILLHERRON@HOTMAIL.COM		
Doreen Minor	1550 McGilvrey Ave	dduran2@aol.com		
Javier Muga	415 S. CLOVERDALE AVE #6 LA. 90036	domiller@unh.edu		
RANI DE LEON		ravideleon@gmail.com		
Sonji M.		Asisuse@ymail.com		



NAME	ADDRESS	EMAIL	PHONE	SIGNATURE
ALEX WOODHEAD		alexatwoodhead@gmail.com		Alex Woodhead
CELESTA CASTELLANOS		celestacastellanos@gmail.com	(323) 810-0175	Celesta Castellanos
LEO LIMON	Yang Na aka Las Angeles	LARIVERCHITZ@Yahoo.com	(323) 434-3479	Leo Limon
RUELA RORTA	4520 Srd Rascall CA 90042	RUELA@GMAIL.COM		Ruela Rorta
MARGARET APNOID	1270 N. Ave 50	Arroyo SJ @ygrub.com		Margaret Apnoide
CATHY MULLIGAN	851 N. AVE 50	cathi.mclauter@gmail.com	323 387.9705	Cathy Mulligan
FRAN WADA	2038 WOLCENBAY ST LA CA 90031	FURBADA2K2@gmail.com	323 225-1012	Fran Wada
MATTHE BENEDECT	1111 Pagoda Place Los Angeles 90031	mfbenedict@earthlink.net	323-226-0017	Matthe Benedect
NICOLE ROSSERT	124 Rosebarn Pl LA CA 90042		323 255 5792	Nicole Rossert
HEINDEHOLUNA	131 N. Ave 50 LA CA 90042	hluna2525@yahoo.com	323 321-4308	Hein Holuna

155 W Washington Blvd., Suite G-1, Los Angeles, CA 90012 (213) 291-6900  
 www.mutualconservancy.org www.facebook.com/mutualconservancy

NAME	ADDRESS	EMAIL	PHONE	SIGNATURE
GILPATER GRENZ	808 N SQUARE ST	GTORPZ@HOTMAIL	(323) 455-7048	
Eric Kopylov	100 Monte Villa Stevia road	eric.kopylov@fbi.gov	211-785-8070	
Mary Mendenhall	14108 Pierce ST DUBLIN, CA 94568	Waltz.Dan@GMAIL.COM		
JOE BRAVO	5656 FAYETTE ST L.A. 90042	JOE BRAVO 60 @Yahoo.com	(323) 219-9221	Joe Bravo
Rodriguez BOARD	121 S ALMA AVE LOS ANGELES CA 90005		(213) 2596777	
NORA	121 S. Alma Ave Los Angeles, CA 90005		646-4168483	Nora
STONIE	378 N Douglas LA 90026		213 377.6125	
<del>Jacky Ayala</del> Jacky Ayala	1600 campus road	Jacky@oxy.edu	707 972-7505	Jacky Ayala
Tina Flores	1600 Campus Rd.	tflores@oxy.edu	(213) 581-2061	
LUNA E SPINOSA	14103 S. Markt St LA 90032	Sabbathnotdogs@yahoo.com	(562) 325-9588	Luna E-Spinosa

NAME	ADDRESS	EMAIL	PHONE	SIGNATURE
Alicia Siles	951 4000 28 St Walt St	Alice@zeppelin @rocketmail.com	(52) 325-8558 Luna Cell	Alice Siles
K. Gallegos	131 N. Ave. 50	arturo@studia	323/255-1435	A. Gallegos
Lilou Ramirez	2127 E 1st LA 90033	lyloun (Email) hofman@comcast.net (323) 3245078		
PAUL DONAZEL	708 S. Boyle Ave	MICHAMURALS@ gmail.com	323 761-3963	
Christina Smith	5709 Tupperley LAWN - LORAINA - CA 90030	michal@lchotmail	213-570-3400	
MURREN CHRISTENSEN	935 W. Ave 37 LA 90065	MURREN@ AOL.com	323-2224035	Maureen
Ana Siqueiros	2631 1/2 Cullen St LA, CA, 90030	Ana@siqueiros@ yahoo.com	310 425-7952	Ana Siqueiros
SARAH MERCHANT	415 S. COVERDALE Ave # 6 L.A. 90036	smc@haman@ virginious.com	67 850 2041	
Paul Ronce	3370 San Gabriel Hwy CA 90030	Paul Ronce@comu.com	818.4063760	
Javier Martinez	417 Hagar St San Fernando CA 91340	jmwrth137@ gmail.com	(818) 642-5521	Javier

155 W Washington Blvd., Suite G-1, Los Angeles, CA 90012 (213) 291-6900  
 www.mutualconservancy.org www.facebook.com/mutualconservancy

NAME	ADDRESS	EMAIL	PHONE	SIGNATURE
David Botello	4952 La Colandria Dr L.A. CA 90032	artedavid@sbcsbcglobal.net	323 225 7575	David Botello
Margaret Garcia	4022 N. Figueroa St L.A. 90065	maggie-G@att.net	323) 243-4153	Margaret Garcia
M. Kellen Taylor	1372 Neblar St LA 90041	engagemkt@gmail.com	323 254 2955	M. Kellen Taylor
Juan Ruvalcaba	3021 E. 2nd St Los Angeles CA 90063	j.ruvalcaba@yahoo.com	(323) 994 1177	Juan Ruvalcaba
ISABEL ROJAS-WILLIAMS	115 W. Washington Blvd L.A. CA 90015	iswilliams@MURALS.org	(213) 291-6900	Isabel Rojas-Williams
Ian Robertson-Salt	155 W. Washington Blvd Suite G-1 LA, CA 90015	irobertson@muralconservancy.org	(213) 291-6900	Ian Robertson-Salt
Kent Twitchell	155 W. Washington Blvd Suite G-1 LA, CA 90015	KENT@TWITCHELL.YAHOO.COM	(310) 709-2037	Kent Twitchell