REPORT OF THE CHIEF LEGISLATIVE ANALYST

DATE: February 19, 2013

TO:

Honorable Members Rules, Elections and

Intergovernmental Relations Committee

FROM:

Gerry F. Miller

Council File No.:

13-0002-S12

Chief Legislative Analyst

Assignment No.:

13-01-0043

SUBJECT:

Resolution (Garcetti-Reyes-Alarcon) to Support federal comprehensive immigration reform.

<u>CLA RECOMMENDATION:</u> Adopt Resolution (Garcetti-Reyes-Alarcon) to include in the City's 2013-2014 Federal Legislative Program, SUPPORT for federal comprehensive immigration reform that creates a pathway towards citizenship for law-abiding, tax-paying immigrant workers and their families; reduces immigration backlogs; offers opportunity for immigrant students to pursue a college education; promotes civil integration; and implements enforcement measures in a humane manner.

SUMMARY

Resolution (Garcetti-Reyes-Alarcon) notes that comprehensive immigration reform is required in light of the 11.1 million undocumented immigrants currently living in the United States, including a large number within the City of Los Angeles, and the \$18 billion spent on immigration enforcement spent nationally every year. The Resolution further notes that current federal policy places extreme burdens onto local government budgets, including the City of Los Angeles. According to the Resolution, budget and economic pressures could be eased by comprehensive immigration reform given that immigrant-owned businesses employ 10 percent of American private-sector workers and generate more than \$775 billion in revenues to the U.S. economy and, while comprising 12.9 percent of the American population, immigrants started 28 percent of American businesses in 2011. Also according to the Resolution, current federal policy discourages immigrants from acquiring the proper documentation and earning citizenship. Finally, the Resolution states that comprehensive immigration reform would acknowledge the dignity, hard work and respect for the United States of many undocumented immigrants. Therefore, the Resolution recommends that the Council support federal immigration reform that: 1) creates a pathway towards citizenship for law-abiding, tax-paying immigrant workers and their families; 2) reduces immigration backlogs; 3) offers opportunity for immigrant students to pursue a college education; 4) promotes civil integration; and 5) implements enforcement measures in a humane manner.

BACKGROUND

On January 15, 2013, Resolution (Garcetti-Reyes-Alarcon) was introduced to support comprehensive immigration reform that contains the following provisions: 1) creates a pathway towards citizenship for law-abiding, tax-paying immigrant workers and their families; 2) reduces immigration backlogs; 3) offers opportunity for immigrant students to pursue a college education; 4) promotes civil integration; and 5) implements enforcement measures in a humane manner. Adoption of the Resolution would be consistent with prior Council action with respect to comprehensive immigration reform. While there are multiple comprehensive immigration reform proposals currently being circulated, this report will focus on the following three major proposals:

- <u>S. 1 The Immigration Reform that Works for America's Future Act. (S. 1)</u>
 U.S. Senator Harry Reid
 January 22, 2012
- White House Comprehensive Immigration Reform Proposal (White House Proposal)
 January 29, 2013
- <u>Bipartisan Framework for Comprehensive Immigration Reform (Bipartisan Proposal)</u>
 Senators: Charles E. Schumer (D-NY), John McCain (R-AZ), Richard Durbin (D-IL),
 Lindsay Graham (R-SC), Robert Menendez (D-NJ), Marco Rubio (R-FL), Michael Bennet (D-CO), Jeff Flake (R-AZ); January 28, 2013



Comparative Analysis of Comprehensive Immigration Reform Proposals

As seen on the Attachment, the three immigration proposals contain provisions that enhance border security, establish a pathway to citizenship and create provisions to expedite the immigration process for certain qualifying individuals. However, the manner in which each proposal would be implemented is different.

Pathway to Citizenship

With respect to establishing a pathway to citizenship, only the Bipartisan proposal and the White House proposal would require immigrants to register with the government as the first step in the pathway to citizenship. All three proposals require learning English, paying back taxes and passing a criminal background check. The White House and the Bipartisan proposals offer probationary or provisional status to immigrants who meet the initial requirements. Once probationary or provisional status has been awarded, applicants must pass an additional background check and will not be issued a green card until those applicants who have been waiting for a green card are issued theirs first. The Bipartisan proposal explicitly requires that prior to issuing a green card to individuals who have been awarded probationary legal status, all proposed enforcement measures must be fully implemented.

Special Treatment for Certain Immigrant Groups

All three proposals contain provisions that would offer an expedited pathway to citizenship for certain immigrant groups. Under each proposal, individuals who entered the United States illegally as minors and continue with their studies would be offered an expedited immigration process. Also, agricultural workers are considered essential to the U.S. economy and are therefore given special treatment. Under the White House and the Bipartisan proposal, individuals who have obtained a Master's degree and/or Ph.D.s in science, technology, engineering or mathematics would be automatically eligible to receive a green card. Additionally, S.1 provides for a system that would permit students with any advanced degree to remain in the U.S.

Same-Sex Partners

The White House proposal provides U.S. residents and citizens with the ability to petition for a visa on the basis of a permanent relationship with a same-sex partner.

Border Security and Enforcement

With respect to enforcement measures, the White House and the Bipartisan proposals are very specific in terms of the types of enforcement measures desired. The Bipartisan proposal provides for improved technology and infrastructure along the U.S. Mexico border, improved radio interoperability and surveillance equipment, and an increase in unmanned aerial vehicles and border patrol agents. As stated earlier, the Bipartisan proposal provides that a pathway to citizenship would only be implemented upon the completion of all border enforcement measures.

The White House proposal also provides for enhanced border security and increases penalties against criminal organizations for human smuggling and drug, money and weapon traffic. The White House proposal strengthens prohibitions against racial profiling and enhances training on civil rights and civil liberties for Department of Homeland Security immigration officers. This proposal provides funding for tribal communities, enhances protections for those least able to represent themselves, and provides for alternatives to detention.

Economic Development Provisions

All three proposals include provisions that affect economic development. For example, S. 1 encourages investment in the U.S. with the purpose of creating jobs. While both the White House and the Bipartisan proposals provide for a reduction in employment-based backlogs, the White House proposal seeks to completely eliminate the annual country caps for employment-based visas. Additionally, the White House proposal provides start-up visas for job creating entrepreneurs and creates a new visa category for federal employees of national security science and technology. The Bipartisan proposal places the burden on businesses to demonstrate that hiring immigrants will not displace American workers. However, this proposal does not clearly define the terms "American" or "immigrant" nor does it acknowledge that there are immigrants who are also U.S. citizens.

Employment Verification System

All three proposals mandate an employment verification system. The White House and the Bipartisan proposals include provisions to hold employers accountable for hiring undocumented workers by increasing fines and penalties for violators. Only the White House proposal would provide tools for employers to verify documents, protect workers against retaliation and create a labor law enforcement fund. This fund is intended to help ensure that industries that employ significant numbers of immigrant workers comply with labor laws.

Upon review of the above three proposals, our Office has determined that at this time, the White House proposal most closely mirrors comprehensive immigration reform as previously supported by the Council and as expressed in Resolution (Garcetti-Reyes-Alarcon). Our Office will continue to monitor all major proposals as they move through the legislative process. We recommend that the City support Resolution (Garcetti-Reyes-Alarcon) which recommends comprehensive immigration reform.

Departments Notified

None.

Felipe Valladolid Chavez Legislative Analyst

Attachments:

- 1) Comparative Analysis of Major Comprehensive Immigration Reform Proposals
- 2) Resolution (Garcetti-Reyes-Alarcon)

GFM:fvc

Comparative Analysis of Comprehensive Immigration Reform Proposals

Establishes a pathway for citizenship Establishes a pathway for citizenship Provides that a pathway to citizenship is contingent upon success in securing borders Requires registration with the government Requires a criminal background check Requires paying fines and fees Requires second the back of the line Requires second background check and national security check Requires learning English Requires learning Civics				٦
enship sontingent upon success in overnment I check ary Status: live and work in US; no feek heck and national security check	1	1	`	
overnment I check ary Status: live and work in US; no fe heck and national security check	•	•	. 5	
Requires a criminal background check Requires paying fines and fees Requires pay back taxes Issues Provisional or Probationary Status: live and work in US; no federal benefits Requires going to the back of the line Requires second background check and national security check Requires learning English Requires learning Civics		>	>	
Requires paying fines and fees Requires pay back taxes Issues Provisional or Probationary Status: live and work in US; no federal benefits Requires going to the back of the line Requires second background check and national security check Requires learning English Requires learning Civics	*	>	>	
Requires pay back taxes Issues Probationary Status: live and work in US; no federal benefits Issues Provisional or Probationary Status: live and work in US; no federal benefits Requires going to the back of the line Requires second background check and national security check Requires learning English Requires learning Civics		>	>	
Issues Provisional or Probationary Status: live and work in US; no federal benefits Requires going to the back of the line Requires second background check and national security check Requires learning English Requires learning Civics	`	>	>	
Requires going to the back of the line Requires second background check and national security check Requires learning English Requires learning Civics		> '	٠, ٠	
Requires second background check and national security check Requires learning English Requires learning Civics		> 1	> '	
Kequires learning English Requires learning Civics		> 1	> 1	
	•	> >	> >	-
Requires registration with the Selective Service		>		
Requires history of work in the US			`	
Requires current employment		,	`	
Promotes keeping families together, eliminates backlogs in the family-sponsored immigration system	on system	>		
Provides that same-sex families be treated as families by giving U.S. citizens and residents the ability to	s the ability to	>		
seek a visa on me basis of a permanent letanorismp with a same-sex parmer				
Economic Development Provisions				
Promotes job creation	<i>></i> '			
Encourages investment in the U.S. and job creation Climinates backlas for sampla meat soons and immigration by eliminating the annual country case		`		
Eminiates bachog for employment-sponsored inmigration by eminiating the annual country. Provides start-up visa for job creating entrepreneurs	S Cabo	` `		
Expands opportunities for investor visas and U.S. economic development		*		
Reduces backlogs for family and employment visas			> 1	
Places burden on employers to demonstrate that hiring undocumented will not displace documented workers. Creates new visa category for empoyaes of federal national security science and fech	Imented workers	`	>	
Creates program to meet the needs of agricultural industry when documented workers are not available to file	not available to fill			
Allows more lower-skilled immigrants to come to US when the economy is creating jobs, and less when it is	less when it is	`	> >	
Provides labor protections Streamlines visa and foreign visitor, low-risk applicants, processing		. >		-
Provides green cards to those who have shown success in the workplace and contributed to their			>	
Protects sustainability of agricultural industry	>			
Special Groups				
Ensures that applicants caming to U.S. as minors earn citizenship by atteding college or joining the armed	ining the armed	> 1	, ,	
Awards green cards to inaster's and Pri.D. graduates; Science, Technology, Engineering and Mathematics Provides expedited process for agricultural workers	nd Marnematics	· >	. >	
Provides Employment verification system exemption for certain small businesses		>		
Welcoms asylum seekers and refugees	1			
	×			
remins and econiages myddals who earred advanced degreess to remain in the Oo				

Comparative Analysis of Comprehensive Immigration Reform Proposals

	ري 1	White House Proposal	Bipartisan Proposal	_
Border Security and Enforcement Provides for enhanced border security	>	. >	`	
Provides for technology and infrastructure		. >	. >	
Improves radio inteoperability and surveilance equipment			\	
Increases border patrol agents			*,	
		,	>	
Combats transnational crime with increased penalties for drug, weapon and numan trafficking Establishes a Southwest Border Commission		>	>	
Improves private-partnerships and establishes border communities and law enforcement		> '		
Funds tribal communities		>	1	_
Strengthens prominitions against radial proming and use or roice. Strengthens training on civil rights and civil liberties for DHS immigration officers.		>	•	
Bolsters efforts to forfit property of criminal organizations		>		
Mandates fraud and tamper-resistant social security cards; improves identity theft Provides for deportation of serious criminal background		> >	\ \	
Increases immigration judges and improves access to information by immigrants		>		_
Enhances protections for those least able to represent themselves		> .		_
Creates administrative or iudicial review for those whose provisional status has been denied Enhances criminal penalties for transpational criminal organizations that traffic in drugs and weapons:		> >		
Establishes border community liaisons to improve communication		>		_
Provides for alternatives to detention and reduces detention costs		>		_
Strenthens law enforcement cooperation to reduce counterterrorism		>		
Visa Processing and Enforcement Provisions				
Establishes Visa Tracking System and/or visa overstay system to ensure compliance		`	`	_
Increases penalities for visa fraud, and riodallo fraud.		. >		
Provides greater flexibility for Visa Waiver Program		. >		
Employer Sanctions and Employee Protections Mandates an Employment Verification System	>	>	`	
Holds employers accountable with fines and penalties		>	* '	41
Requires workers to demonstrate to prospective employers legal status and identity Establishes a method fines and penalties to prevent identity that		>	> >	
Provides tools for employer verification system		>		
Increases penalties for hiring undocumented workers		<i>></i> '		
Protects workers against retallation Creates a labor law enforcement find		> >		

2 of 2

12-0002-512

RESOLUTION

JAN 1 5 2013

WHEREAS, President Obama this week called for immigration reform, following previous statements that significant immigration reform would be part of his early second term agenda; and,

WHEREAS, comprehensive immigration reform is required in light of the 11.1 million undocumented immigrants currently living in the United States, including a large number within the City of Los Angeles, and the \$18 billion spent on immigration enforcement spent nationally every year; and,

WHEREAS, current federal policy places extreme burdens onto local government budgets, including that of the City of Los Angeles, and;

WHEREAS, budget and economic pressures could be eased by comprehensive immigration reform given that immigrant-owned businesses employ 10 percent of American private-sector workers and generate more than \$775 billion in revenues to the U.S. economy and, while comprising 12.9 percent of the American population, immigrants started 28 percent of American businesses in 2011, and;

WHEREAS, current federal policy discourages immigrants from acquiring the proper documentation and earning citizenship, and;

WHEREAS, comprehensive immigration reform would acknowledge the dignity, hard work and respect for the United States of many undocumented immigrants;

NOW, THEREFORE BE IT RESOLVED that by the adoption of this Resolution the Los Angeles City Council with the concurrence of the Mayor, hereby includes in the City of Los Angeles 2013-2014 Federal Legislative Programs SUPPORT for federal comprehensive immigration reform that creates a pathway towards citizenship for law-abiding, tax paying immigrant workers and their families; reduces immigration backlogs; offers opportunity for immigrant students to pursue a college education; promotes civil integration; and implements enforcement measures in a humane manner.

PRESENTED BY:

ERIC GARCETTI

Councilmember, 13th District

SECONDED BY:

1/15/13

EPR