COMMUNITY COMPLIANCE & MONITORING PROGRAM REPORT

MARCH 2015

REPORT CONTENTS

- Community Monitoring Goals
- The Black Jobs Crisis
- MTA PLA Report Results
- Community Monitoring Protocol
- Community Monitoring Results
- Community-Proposed Solutions

"We applaud the LA Black Worker Center efforts and work with them toward the common goal of bringing our economies together for a stronger Los Angeles. As one of the most diverse cities in the world, we strive toward an equity agenda that ensures that workplaces look like our city. Crenshaw shows that bringing community, agencies, unions, and employers to the co-enforcement table puts us closer to our common goal. We must continue the hard work to address worker under-representation on all MTA construction projects and achieve a diverse and representative workforce throughout Los Angeles County."

-Los Angeles Mayor Eric Garcetti
COMMUNITY MONITORING GOALS

LABWC’s Community Compliance and Monitoring Program works to ensure Metro, contractor, subcontractor and union compliance with the spirit of the Project Labor Agreement (PLA) governing the $2.4 billion Crenshaw/LAX Rail Construction project.

Our benchmark for success on the Crenshaw/LAX project is 25% Black participation, 5% female participation, and 20% apprenticeship participation.

A representative workforce allows all workers to share in the opportunity created by their tax dollars. Fairness in hiring allows workers, their families, and neighborhoods to thrive. It also brings our local Los Angeles economies closer together.

This report is an example of our deep support for the successful implementation of the PLA/CCP and an effort to inform our large constituency on the progress of the PLA/CCP projects, contractor compliance data, and the involvement of our community. We begin by summarizing Metro’s reporting data, and then discuss the findings from LABWC community monitoring.

THE BLACK JOBS CRISIS

Now more than ever, there is an acute need for access to good, union, middle-class jobs in the Black community. Fifty years after the March on Washington, Black unemployment is more than twice the rate of white unemployment—just as it was in 1963. The situation is particularly bad in Los Angeles, where the Black unemployment rate is a staggering 18 percent and 30 percent of Black workers earn less than $12 an hour.

Construction jobs can provide individuals with well-paying work building and improving our city (mean hourly wage: $23.21, mean public sector wage: $26.33). However, Blacks are grossly underrepresented in the construction sector, making up just 2% of union construction workers in Los Angeles, where they are 9% of the population and 10% of new apprentices.

Metro’s historic PLA is an opportunity to reverse the underrepresentation of Blacks in public construction and improve the lives of individuals and communities through quality jobs. The Crenshaw/LAX Rail Project goes through the Crenshaw district, a historically Black neighborhood where the median income is 35% lower than the city average.
COMMUNITY MONITORING PROTOCOL

The LA BWC has developed a community monitoring tool based on observational field work and data collection. First, community members are trained in observational field work, data collection, construction site safety, and Metro PLA specifics. Then volunteer members are deployed to pre-selected construction sites, on both Metro PLA and non-Metro, non-PLA projects, so worker diversity can be compared. Volunteers work in teams to systematically count workers by race and gender, record their qualitative observations and reflections, and document potential safety violations. The same sites are monitored several times on different days over the course of a month. LA BWC staff analyzes this data and compiles it into a quarterly report for the public.

This report is based on field work from 25 volunteers that completed over 70 hours of observation and data collection.

“The construction of the Crenshaw line is helping to improve the community and change people’s lives. Because of the PLA and diversity language, Metro is putting people from our community to work in good jobs, and the community is being informed about good, union careers.”

- IBEW Local 11 Journeyman Electrician and BWC Member Deon Watson

MTA Targeted Hire Report Results

The following data on MTA hiring statistics by disadvantaged workers status, race/ethnicity, gender, and apprenticeship status was obtained from monthly reports published on www.metro.net.

“In the City of L.A., diversity means access to an equitable and representative workforce. Enforcement means real collaboration between agencies, employers, contractors and the community. I applaud the LA BWC for this informative report, which shows good policy and robust enforcement is how we can make a difference in the underrepresentation of Black workers and women on these projects.”

-LA City Councilman Curren Price, CD9
DISADVANTAGED WORKERS

According to the most recent Metro Targeted Hire Report (December 2014), both the Utility Relocation and Design Build phase of the Crenshaw/LAX Project are surpassing targets for economically disadvantaged workers, a positive step we applaud.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Target</th>
<th>40%</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Actual</td>
<td>61%</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Utility Relocation

* Total project hours: 63,000.
  Completion: 100%.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Target</th>
<th>40%</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Actual</td>
<td>59%</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Design Build

* Total project hours: 3,000,000.
  Completion: 10.5%.

For more information about the Disadvantaged Worker term, or any other term used here, a copy of the PLA is available on the Metro website.

RACE/ETHNICITY

The PLA states that the "agreement reflects a commitment by all parties to the diversity in the workforce hiring that reflect levels of minority, women, and other worker utilization at levels which are representative of the relevant workforce of these groups in the Greater Los Angeles County Area."

Our efforts to work with LA Metro, unions and contractors has contributed to Black workers completing 11.6% of the Utility Relocation hours (project completed) and 19% of the Design Build hours (project 10.5% completed) thus far on the Crenshaw/LAX project. These numbers exceed recent levels of Black worker participation on public construction projects, and are approaching our goal of 25% participation.

Through Black participation rates fluctuated dramatically at the beginning of the project, they appear to have stabilized at around 20% on the Design/Build portion of the project over the last 2 months.

GENDER

Utility Relocation: 0.52%

Design Build: 2.8%

Female underrepresentation on the Crenshaw/LAX project is striking. However, the Design/Build project has increased female participation by almost 1% since our last report.
APPRENTICES

Currently, the Crenshaw/LAX Transit Project is not meeting Metro's commitment for apprentice hours. This is a critical component of increasing diversity, since this process brings new workers into the trades.

Section 7.5.2 of the PLA Agreement states apprentices should work 20% of total project hours.

TARGET

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Utility Relocation</th>
<th>Design Build</th>
<th>Apprentice</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>14%</td>
<td>12%</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Apprenticeship Hours

OTHER MTA PROJECTS

While the LA BWC has focused our monitoring resources on the Crenshaw/LAX project, there are additional Metro projects that are governed by the PLA, including the Regional Connector (37.6% complete); Westside Utilities (30% complete); and Westside Shaft: (100% complete)

The Metro policy demonstrates that PLAs, combined with construction career policies, are a step toward ensuring fair representation, which is necessary to strengthen the regional economy. Unfortunately, the very low rates of Black and female workers hired on these projects show that without contractor compliance, community co-enforcement models and improved worker referral and dispatching, the PLA targets will likely not be met. Greater resources aimed at enforcing labor standards, especially anti-discrimination, diversity and inclusion, are necessary to give underrepresented workers access to these work opportunities.

Additional Metro PLA Projects
EXPO II PROJECT

The Expo II project, which is subject to a PLA, has higher Black participation rates than the Regional Connector and Westside Utility projects.

On the other hand, the Expo II project has far lower Disadvantaged Local worker participation rates than Metro's PLA projects.

COMMUNITY MONITORING RESULTS

Overall, the results of LA BWC's monitoring aligns with Metro's own data; while the Crenshaw/LAX project is making great strides to living up to the PLA's diversity clause and providing opportunities for all workers in Los Angeles, projects without a PLA and LA BWC co-enforcement and diversity strategies, including community monitoring, have very low rates of participation from underrepresented workers.

"Being the eyes and ears of the LA BWC is most satisfying in many ways. I know I’m making a difference, if not today, tomorrow, if not tomorrow, next week, if not next week, next year."

- Johnny, Carpenter
COMMUNITY REFLECTIONS

Community members reacted to their experiences related to the community monitoring process.

**Eyes are open to reality on the ground.**

"I think that Black workers are severely underrepresented at the construction site. 0 Black people out of almost 60 construction workers is insane and needs to be improved ASAP. My experience from the community monitoring was eye-opening. I saw first-hand how so much work is being done at the construction site without Black people being included. It is important for me and my community that I had this experience because I feel moved to take action to help correct this injustice."

-Marcel, unemployed Pre-Apprentice Pipefitter

**Demanding better representation.**

"We must continue to fight!"

-Yvette, former Apprentice Electrician, IBEW 11

"This report shows much more enforcement is needed. Black workers matter in LA and on these construction sites. We need this level of monitoring and enforcement on all major construction sites across the city."

-Pastor K.W. Tulloss, Weller Street Missionary Baptist Church President and Western Region Director, National Action Network.

**Empowered and hopeful.**

"I hope it opens doors and allows us to gain entrance to the job market."

-Lloyd, Journeyman Painter, IUPAT

"Blacks in Los Angeles are holding their breath as the Crenshaw/LAX Rail Project holds their attention. Crenshaw is called "The Shaw" in street culture, implying ownership and family chemistry. We simply must insist on employment and access to apprenticeship programs on a construction project that runs through our midst, yet perpetuates a legacy of under-serving and under-serving in equity. We stand shoulder to shoulder in demanding that statistics show balance in racial and gender utilization."

Rev. Cecil L. "Chip" Murray, Co-founder, the Cecil Murray Center for Community Engagement, USC; Former Pastor First AME
COMMUNITY-PROPOSED SOLUTIONS

Stakeholder Success Meetings
We suggest Metro bring Walsh/Shea, key subcontractors, the building trades, and community organizations together in regular meetings to assess progress and address challenges in meeting diversity in hiring goals. Contractors that are having success in meeting diversity goals can share their strategies, while those having difficulty can receive the support they need to address challenges.

Worker Readiness Training
Policymakers and agency administrators should prioritize investment in pre-apprenticeship programs targeting underrepresented worker populations. To make sure disadvantaged workers have access to the training and support needed to succeed, Metro should invest in community-based outreach, tutoring, and mentoring programs that target underrepresented workers, such as BWC's "Ready to Work" program.

Wage Transparency
Current monthly Metro reports document hours worked by disadvantaged worker status, race, gender, and apprenticeship status. This is a very useful step, but more is needed. Monthly wage data would allow stakeholders to examine whether all groups have equal access to opportunities on the job site.

Vigorous Enforcement
In order to increase its construction workforce to a minimum of 10% Black worker participation, the City must:
1) Conduct a comprehensive audit of the racial and gender makeup of public construction sites
2) Establish a robust Office of Labor Standards and Enforcement to vigorously enforce wage and labor standards with tough penalties for violators

Employer and Worker Training
To ensure workers and employers are aware of the laws governing workforce composition, we suggest Metro conduct worker and employer trainings that cover the Office of Federal Contract Compliance Program's (OFCCP) regulations. Metro could work in partnership with OFFCP to conduct these trainings.

CONTACT US:
For further information on the LABWC Community Compliance & Monitoring Project, please contact us by phone or email.
If you are a worker interested in training or recruitment information, please contact us or call PV Jobs at (323) 432-3955.

labblackworkercenter.org
labblackworkers@gmail.com
(323)752-7287
@BlackWkrCenter
facebook.com/LABWC

REFERENCES:
Metro Target Hire Reports:
http://www.metro.net/about/pla/c0990-crenshaw-lax-advanced-utility-relocations/
http://www.metro.net/about/pla/co988-crenshaw-lax-transit-corridor-designbuild/
http://www.metro.net/about/pla/c0981r-regional-connector/
http://www.metro.net/about/pla/c1034-westside-subway-extension-exploratory-shaft/

Black Jobs Crisis Data
Bureau of Labor Statistics data on metropolitan unemployment (Table 27): http://www.bls.gov/opub/gp/pdf/gp12_27.pdf:
http://locallabs.org/90008 (based on Census data)