DEPARTMENT OF PUBLIC WORKS

ADOPTED BY THE BOARD PUBLIC WORKS OF THE CITY of Los Angeles California

APR 1 7 2015

Executive Officer Board of Public Works

BUREAU OF SANITATION BOARD REPORT NO. 2 April 17, 2015

CD: ALL

ENVIRONMENTALLY PREFERABLE PURCHASING (EPP) ANNUAL REPORT FY2013-14

RECOMMENDATIONS

The Bureau of Sanitation (LASAN) recommends that the Board of Public Works approve and forward this report to the Mayor and City Council with the following recommendations:

- 1. Council receive and file this report;
- 2. LASAN continues to educate City employees about the EPP Program to increase awareness and purchases of environmentally-preferable products in place of traditional products;
- 3. General Services Department (GSD) and LASAN work with the selected purchasing system vendor, CGI, to develop and test an automated tracking system to develop a baseline and chart the City's progress in the EPP arena. The ideal system would track multiple EPP attributes (energy-efficient, low toxicity), common units (gallons, reams) and the level of recycled content in products purchased. LASAN encourages Proprietary departments to use a tracking method as detailed as, and compatible with, the GSD system;
- 4. City departments are encouraged to test and use the tracking method currently used by LASAN to collect data from EPP purchases until an automated method is implemented.
- 5. LASAN develops a working group consisting of staff from different departments, including proprietary departments, to review expiring contracts and RFPs, incorporate EPP-related specifications into future bids and RFPs, create an EPP specification library, and to evaluate potential changes to the EPP Ordinance;
- 6. LASAN promotes the use of the Harbor Department's comprehensive Green Product Evaluation form and flowchart for evaluating EPP products. (See Attachment 3)

TRANSMITTALS

- 1. Vendor EPP Reports
- 2. Department EPP Reports
- 3. Proprietary Department EPP Reports
- 4. GSD 2013 AB939 Buy Recycled Report
- 5. 2014 Clean Your Files Campaign Flyer
- 6. GHG Reports: Asphalt and Concrete, Cartridges, Fuel, and Paper

Page 2

FISCAL IMPACT

Approval of this report will have no fiscal impact on the General Fund as the EPP Ordinance stipulates that the City of Los Angeles increase its purchase of environmentally-friendly products while remaining fiscally responsible.

DISCUSSION

Background

The City of Los Angeles adopted the Environmentally-Preferable Purchasing (EPP) Program in June 2009 through Ordinance 180751. The Ordinance expanded the existing green purchasing policies established through *Buy Recycled 2000* and requires each City department to report annually on its EPP practices. LASAN assumed the operation of the program from GSD in July 2010.

Environmental attributes to be considered in selecting products include the following: recyclability in existing recycling programs, post-consumer recycled material, pollutant releases, waste generation, energy and water consumption, depletion of natural resources, and potential impact on human health and the environment.

As a large purchaser, the City's purchases help foster a market for environmentally-preferable products by motivating more companies to produce them. The environmental impacts based on the collected data are discussed on Page 12.

Green Vendors for the City of Los Angeles

Vendor participation is a key component of annual EPP reporting since the City currently does not have an automated procurement tracking system. City departments have also been asked to provide information about their EPP practices, as required by the EPP Ordinance. Many of the GSD-issued contracts require vendors to report on EPP purchases, per the following contract language: "The supplier shall provide the City Purchasing Agent with quarterly reports, to include the following: Environmentally Preferable Product (EPP) Report that indicates the quantity and description of products sold to the City that are considered EPP. This information may be included in the Expenditure Report."

LASAN received EPP reports from the following vendors: Grainger[®], Hewlett-Packard[®], Liberty Paper[©], Office Depot[®], Printing Technology, Inc.[®], Recycled Aggregate Materials Company, SC Fuels[™], Unisource[®], and Vista Paint.

Page 3

<u>Grainger[®]</u>

Grainger[®] provides the City with a wide array of EPP supplies including low Volatile Organic Compound (VOC) cleaning chemicals and adhesives; non-corrosive degreasers; Energy Starrated power tools such as power drills and circular saws; recycled-content ladders, cabinets, storage lockers, and trash bags; and Light-Emitting Diode (LED) lamps.

• The City of Los Angeles spent \$144,221 on EPP products from Grainger[®].

Hewlett-Packard (HP®)

HP[®] provides the City with computer equipment and printers.

• The City spent \$5.66M on equipment certified by EPEAT[®] and Energy Star. EPEAT[®] is a global rating and certification initiative that identifies greener computer and electronic equipment options. EPEAT[®] reviews attributes beyond energy efficiency, so the certified computers are also less toxic and easier to recycle.

Liberty Paper[©]

Liberty Paper[®] provides the City with standard office copier/printer paper. The contract offers 30%, 50%, and 100% post-consumer recycled-content paper.

- The City spent a total of \$1.52M on recycled-content office paper. Of that total amount, \$1.38M was spent on 30% recycled-content paper.
- Thirty percent recycled-content paper was purchased most frequently and totaled 1,286 tons.

Office Depot[®]

Office Depot[®] provides the City's Council-controlled departments with various EPP office supplies. Office Depot[®] has a large line of EPP products in its Green Book[®] catalog and on its GreenerOffice[™] website. The company continues to expand its green product line and has a "shades of green" product rating system of Light, Mid and Dark Green. The latter have either multiple green attributes or the highest level of a single green attribute. They have been active at promoting EPP office supplies to City Departments.

• Thirty-four percent (\$798,365) of the total \$2.36M was spent on EPP Office Depot[®] supplies. This is a 3% increase from FY2012-13.

Printing Technology, Inc. (PTi®)

PTi[®] provides the City of Los Angeles with remanufactured cartridges for use in a variety of printers. Remanufactured toner cartridges reduce waste as used cartridges are collected, repaired, and refilled instead of being discarded. PTi[®] also provides free pickup of empty cartridges from City departments and remanufactures them locally in Chatsworth, CA.

Page 4

- The City spent \$293,248 on 7,853 remanufactured cartridges from PTi[®].
- PTi[®] collected 11,756 used toner and inkjet cartridges from City facilities for use in the remanufacturing process.

Recycled Aggregate Materials Company (RAMCO)

RAMCO collects and recycles concrete and asphalt from the City through a program with the Department of Public Works, Bureau of Street Services. In FY2013-14, the program recycled 140,092 tons. RAMCO recycles the concrete and asphalt into aggregate base material, which is turned into various products such as Greenrock, a 100% recycled concrete ground cover, and Recycled Concrete Aggregate that is used as fill sand for pipe bedding.

• The City spent \$39,371 to purchase 8,168 tons of the recycled crushed base materials from RAMCO.

<u>SC Fuels</u>[™]

SC Fuels[™] is the City's vendor for reformulated gasoline, a fuel made with a minimum of 10% ethanol, as mandated by the State of California. Reformulated gasoline provides many environmental benefits including reduced airborne pollutants and emissions. A 2002 environmental report by the California Environmental Protection Agency's Air Resources Board (CARB) showed that statewide use of reformulated gasoline provided significant reductions in ozone, particulate matter precursor emissions, and toxic air pollutants.

• The City reduced its fuel usage from FY2012-13 to FY2013-14 by 122,440. This is a 61% decrease compared to the FY2011-12 to FY2012-13 drop of 74,673 gallons. The decrease can be attributed to City employees using public transportation such as the DASH, conversion to fuel-efficient fleet vehicles, and carpooling to meetings, etc. The City purchased a total of 2,547,431 gallons from SC Fuels[™].

<u>Unisource[®]</u>

The City contracts with Unisource[®] for its supply of janitorial products. Unisource[®] provides a variety of EPP products certified by Green Seal[®], EcoLogo[™], and other third-party certifiers. Their EPP product line includes low-VOC bathroom cleansers, recycled-content toilet paper, chemical-free floor strippers, low-VOC deodorizers, etc.

• The City spent \$1.28M on EPP products from Unisource[®].

<u>Vista Paint</u>

Vista Paint provides the City with low odor or low-VOC paint.

• The City spent \$57,206 on green certified paint.

Page 5

City Department Green Purchasing

LASAN requested an annual EPP report from each City Department, including Proprietary Departments. The reports include the following information: EPP purchases for the fiscal year, EPP products tested, and any EPP programs that were implemented. Highlights of these individual reports are below. The full reports submitted by departments are found in Attachments 2 and 3.

- (Aging): The Department of Aging's General Manager's office issued a memo reminding staff to seek out EPP products when making purchases. The Department also reduces paper usage by scanning copies in lieu printing hard copies for distribution, follows the City's duplex copy policy, and uses the back of used single-printed sheets of paper. Eight-five percent (85%) of the total \$3,802 spent in office supplies were for EPP products.
- (BCA): The Department of Public Works, Bureau of Contract Administration purchased EPEAT[®]-certified computers, fifty percent (50%) and one hundred percent (100%) recycled-content paper, and Greenguard[®]-certified office chairs. One hundred percent (100%) of the total \$300,619 spent in these three categories went towards EPP products.
- (BOE): The Department of Public Works, Bureau of Engineering decreased its overall spending on office products by reusing folders and binders, and refilling pens. Fifty-five percent (55%) of the \$26,872 in office supply expenditures were for EPP products, which is a seven percent (7%) increase compared to the previous fiscal year.
- (BOSS): The Department of Public Works, Bureau of Street Services distributed memos and met with staff to discuss the feasibility of using EPP products. BOSS purchased \$12,287 in EPP office supplies; thirty-four percent (34%) of the total amount spent on supplies.
- (BSL): The Department of Public Works, Bureau of Street Lighting spent over \$2.2M on LED lights and materials for its LED Conversion Program. They tested LED products from twenty different vendors. BSL estimates that upgrading City street lights to LED lights would lead to forty percent (40%) in energy savings.
- (CAO): The City Administrative Office adopted the use of refillable pens and spent \$18,615 in office supplies; EPP supplies represent eighty-three percent (83%) of the total.
- (CEC): The City Ethics Commission purchases EPP office supplies such as refillable pens and recycled-content binders. They encouraged staff to purchase EPP products during a staff meeting. Twenty-six percent (26%) of office supply expenditures were for EPP products.

Page 6

- (City Clerk): City Clerk is conducting a pilot to implement the use of reusable envelopes, boxes, and portable voting kiosks to replace single-use materials for election operations. The purchase of reusable materials will lead to an approximate savings of \$35,000 per election cycle.
- (CLA): The Chief Legislative Analyst purchased \$27,822 in EPP office supplies; thirtynine (39%) of total office supply purchases. The CLA currently uses refillable pens and will test other office supplies on contract.
- (Controller): The Office of the Controller reports that the remanufactured toner cartridges from PTi[®] have a good performance in their printers. Remanufactured cartridges represent eighty-seven (87%) of the total cartridge expense. Employees attended the 2013 EPP Office Product Vendor Fair.
- (CTD): Convention and Tourism Development, formerly known as the Los Angeles Convention Center (LACC), followed the LACC Sustainable Purchasing Policy and implemented the purchase of EPP products before the City Council awarded the management contract to AEG Management LACC, LLC (AEG), effective December 2013. The Management Agreement requires AEG to follow the City's sustainability programs. Prior to the management change, they purchased a variety of EPP products including but not limited to: bulk purchases of citrus cleaner and paper towels to reduce packaging, rechargeable batteries, durable poster boards for signage, and low-VOC paint and supplies.
- (DCA): The Department of Cultural Affairs implemented a variety of waste reduction programs, decreasing the need to purchase items such as pre-printed letterhead, new office furniture and equipment, and disposable kitchenware. DCA purchased fifty percent (50%) recycled-content paper, LED lighting for art displays, and reusable kitchenware including mugs, plates, and utensils for staff use. The Department follows the Arts Earth Partnership sustainability guidelines.
- (EMD): The Emergency Management Department tested refillable pens made of recycled material. They determined that the performance was very good and implemented it as the standard pen for the department. Forty-eight percent (48%) of the money spent on office supplies went towards EPP products.
- (ERB): The Employee Relations Board purchased \$303 in recycled-content copy paper.
- (EWDD): The Economic and Workforce Development Department, formerly known as the Community Development Department, purchased \$10,256 in recycled-content paper. Seventy-six percent (76%) of the total money spent on towels and cleaning products went towards EPP cleaning supplies.
- (Finance): The Office of Finance spent \$9,448 on EPP office supplies; twenty-nine percent (29%) of the total spent. The department will continue to test other EPP office supplies.

Page 7

- (GSD): The General Services Department purchases Energy Star[®] -certified air conditioners, pumps, boilers and other electronic equipment, as well as one hundred percent (100%) recycled-content filters, EPP office products, low-VOC paint, low-wattage light bulbs and lamps, and EPP cleaning supplies. GSD Publishing Services purchased a printing plate machine that produces printing plates without high VOC chemicals. They also use soy-based ink and low-VOC chemicals to clean the press machines. The department purchases large volumes of material for City-wide use.
- (HCIDLA): The Housing Community Investment Department of Los Angeles, formerly known as the Los Angeles Housing Department, tested ergonomic mesh-bottom chairs made of fifty-five percent (55%) post-consumer waste. Stains tend to be the number one reason for fabric-bottomed chair replacements. Therefore, the department included the mesh bottom in their specification to reduce the number of future replacement requests. To decrease unnecessary purchases, the department maintains a reuse area for usable office supplies such as used chairs and binders, and works with GSD to create scratch pads from used single-sided paper.
- (LAAS): The Department of Animal Services formed a "Green Team" that meets monthly to review their Department's EPP program. It is forming a green cleaning subcommittee to look into the feasibility of replacing products used at the animal shelter facilities with EPP alternatives. LAAS also practices water and energy conservation through droughttolerant landscaping, water-efficient nozzles, lighting timers, and energy-efficient bulbs and equipment. The department also lowered its fuel consumption.
- (LACERS): The Los Angeles City Employee Retirement System purchased \$9,014 in EPP office supplies, thirty-nine percent (39%) of the total spent on Office Depot products. Of the two vehicles owned by the department, one is a hybrid vehicle.
- (LADBS): The Los Angeles Department of Building and Safety tested one hundred percent (100%) recycled-content paper and encouraged staff to switch from using original equipment manufacturer (OEM) cartridges to remanufactured cartridges through a department-wide email.
- (LAFPP): The Los Angeles Fire and Police Pensions purchased \$5,186 of recycledcontent paper.
- (LAPD): The Los Angeles Police Department tested a hybrid forklift and a hybrid vehicle for sworn officer use. The Department is undergoing additional testing to identify EPP products that meet their operational needs. New LAPD facilities, both refurbished and new construction, incorporate green building standards. The LAPD purchasing group promotes the EPP program through routine emails and hosts EPP classes with purchasing staff from all LAPD stations.

Page 8

- (LASAN): LASAN purchased 4.5 million gallons of natural gas (LNG or CNG) for the 554 clean fuel vehicles, seventy-eight percent (78%) of the Solid Resources Collection fleet which services LA residents. When compared to standard gasoline, this volume of natural gas leads to an estimated GHG reduction of 4,390 MTCO₂e for FY13-14. LASAN will look into expanding the use of EPP products with its contracted service vendors. LASAN tested a variety of EPP office products including presentation binders, office chairs, and highlighters and introduced them as the standard supplies.
- (Library): The Library Department purchased recycled-content library supplies. Thirtyone percent (31%) of the money spent on library supplies went towards EPP products. The Department tested an EPP graffiti removal product that was effective for removing pen and marker graffiti on walls and desks.
- (Personnel): The Personnel Department purchased remanufactured toner cartridges, and recycled-content office supplies and paper. EPP products made up fifty-five percent (55%) of the amount spent on office supplies.
- (Rec and Parks): The Department of Recreation and Parks tested a variety of EPP products including LED lights, insecticides, adhesive sealant, and coil cleaner. The Department installed synthetic soccer fields made of one hundred percent (100%) recycled automobile tires and recycled rubber surfacing at playgrounds. The synthetic soccer fields potentially save 2.2M gallons of water annually.
- (Zoo): The Los Angeles Zoo spent over \$300,000 on EPP products including janitorial supplies, remanufactured toner cartridges, pharmaceuticals for the animals, veterinary supplies, construction supplies and tools, and office supplies. The Department also replaced twenty-eight refrigerators with Energy Star[®]-rated models through LADWP's refrigerator exchange program.

Proprietary Department Green Purchasing

In line with the EPP Ordinance, the Department of Water and Power (DWP), the Los Angeles World Airports (LAWA), and the Harbor Department (Harbor) submitted statistics from departmental green activities. Some of the highlights include:

DWP formed a Green Team to work on the EPP program and sustainability issues. They
hosted a Go Green Fair for DWP employees to promote EPP products. The department
also purchased Energy Star[®]-rated computers and equipment, implemented the *Print
Less* Program to reduce paper usage, and tested EPP vehicles and hand dryers. Eightynine percent (89%) of the total amount spent on cleaning supplies for the John Ferraro
Building was for EPP products.

Page 9

- LAWA formed an EPP Green Team comprised of Procurement Services and the Environmental and Land Use Planning Divisions. The team will work on developing a process for reviewing and approving EPP products and product substitutions, creating purchasing standards, and developing EPP specifications for requests for proposals and requests for quotes. To promote EPP products within the Department, the EPP Green Team held an EPP product giveaway.
- Harbor formed its Green Team and adopted the Department's EPP policy under Resolution No. 6525 in 2008. They created an EPP flowchart to lay out the process of selecting, evaluating, and implementing EPP products into its operations. The Green Team was renewed in FY2013-14. Harbor spent \$836,000 on EPP products including janitorial cleaning supplies, tools, marine paint, paper, compressed natural gas dump trucks, and an electric stakebed truck.

Citywide Buy Recycled Data

GSD reports on the City's Buy Recycled Program on a calendar year basis for the State's mandated AB939 report. For calendar year 2013, the City purchased approximately \$15.4M in recycled-content products including re-refined oil, retread tires, auto parts, etc. (See Attachment 4 for more details.)

LASAN EPP Activities for FY2013-14

LASAN's annual *Clean Your Files Month* campaign retained the focus on GHG emissions associated with paper usage. (See campaign flyer in Attachment 5). This annual City Facilities campaign, held every April, focuses on clearing out old paperwork and reducing paper usage. The 2014 campaign again challenged departments to test 10 cases of 50% or 100% recycled-content paper (versus the standard 30%). The environmental benefits associated with the 10 cases would be as follows:

Recycled-Content	<u>50%</u>	<u>100%</u>
Trees Saved*	1	4
GHG Reduction*	103 lbs. CO ₂	362 lbs. CO ₂
Water Savings*	561 gallons	1963 gallons

*Source: Environmental Paper Network

EPP Education

LASAN provides EPP training for City departments to educate employees about opportunities to incorporate EPP products into their regular purchases. LASAN gave two EPP classes in FY2013-14, training 29 City employees from LADBS and DWP. Attendees were provided with samples of various EPP products to test in their offices. Sanitation will continue to provide EPP training for City departments. For efficiency purposes, EPP training has been incorporated into the City Facilities Recycling Program class.

Page 10

LASAN presented a PowerPoint presentation on the topic of Metrics and Measures in relation to the City's EPP Program at this year's U.S. Zero Waste Conference in Atlanta, Georgia in May 2014.

Meetings with Mayor's Office of Sustainability

LA Sanitation has been meeting with Susana Reyes from the Mayor's Office of Sustainability since October 2013 with GSD and the proprietary departments. Meetings with all Department EPP contacts were held on January 28, 2014 and June 26, 2014. During the first meeting, attendees split up into breakout sessions to discuss EPP tracking and various EPP products outside the scope of standard office supplies. The second meeting introduced the department EPP representatives to the Sustainable Purchasing Leadership Council and an organization called One Drop. Each organization gave a brief presentation. LASAN discussed the use of an EPP tracking method used by the Bureau.

EPP Tracking Method

LASAN continues tracking EPP purchases through the use of a subtask in the funding string. The key to using this tracking method is to ensure that purchasing staff use the subtask for all EPP purchases. Not all departments will be able to use this method since some departments may have a designated use for their subtask, per Controller's Office. In FY2013-14, LASAN expanded the tracking method to include purchases made using petty cash, purchasing cards, and direct expenditures.

Tracking was discussed at both of the above-referenced EPP meetings. Sample Departmental memos and forms about tracking were posted on the EPP website at <u>http://www.environmentla.org/cgbp/EPP-CityStaff.html</u> and emailed to all EPP contacts to use in FY2014-15.

Future Plans – FY2014-15 (Current Activities)

- Meetings with software vendor CGI to ensure that a method for tracking EPP purchases (and product attributes) is included in FMS 2.0 development
- Coordinating with GSD Supply Services Director to address contract bid review process, develop EPP bid specifications, etc.
- Forming Civic Center Green Team that will focus on EPP (and zero waste) efforts
- Establish an EPP bid specification library to be shared by all Departments
- Pilot project with Climate Earth to determine the City's GHG impact from its purchases

Environmental Impact of the EPP Program

LASAN researched various GHG calculators. The City purchases several thousand commodities, and calculators do not exist for all of them. Additionally, the calculators utilize different assumptions and require information that may or may not be readily available. Calculators were found for concrete, paper, printer cartridges, and fuel.

Page 11

Using data provided by RAMCO, Liberty Paper[©], PTi[®], and SC Fuels[™], LASAN estimates that the City reduced its GHG emissions by 2,391 MTCO₂e based on the four commodities. The GHG reports from the various calculators are detailed in Attachment 6.

BSL estimates that the LED Conversion Program will reduce carbon emissions by approximately 40,500 metric tons per year and anticipates a savings of over \$10M per year in energy and repair costs, and an overall 40% reduction in energy use.

Through the use of 554 clean fuel refuse collection vehicles, LASAN estimates that it reduced its GHG emissions by 2,440 MTCO₂e for FY13-14. The GHG reductions based on the six commodities are summarized below.

Commodity	Purchases	GHG Reduction (MTCO₂e)	Equivalencies
Asphalt Concrete	8,168 tons recycled asphalt & concrete	983	Saved 110,611 gallons of fuel
Cartridges	11,756 remanufactured cartridges	36	Saved 82.9 barrels of oil
Fuel	Reduced fuel consumption by 122,440 gallons (compared to FY12-13)	1,008	Removed 229 cars from the road for 1 year
Paper	1,242 tons recycled-content paper	364	Saved 9,307 trees
	Subtotal Citywide	2,391	
Vehicles	554 refuse collection clean fuel vehicles (LASAN estimate based on fuel	4,390	Saved 5,674 barrels of oil
Lights	LED lights for City streets (BSL estimate)	40,500	Electricity to power 5,572 homes for 1 year
Total GHG Reduction (based on six commodities)		47,281	

GHG Savings FY2013-14 Based on Six Commodities

The City's EPP program has a beneficial impact on the environment-by helping to reduce resource and energy consumption. LASAN will continue its efforts to educate City employees about EPP opportunities and the resulting positive environmental effects.

Respectfully submitted,

ENRIQUE C. ZALDIVAR, Director Bureau of Sanitation

Prepared by: Marivic Sabillo, SRCRD