

Communication from Public

Name: robert dunn

Date Submitted: 02/15/2020 11:05 AM

Council File No: 16-1357

Comments for Public Posting: I am against this ordinance as written: 1. Exhibitors that have all qualified permits are not are not mentioned 2. All exotics should not be in one group. Example it says I cannot shop up to certain events with a something as small as a Hedgehog 3. Time frame for acquiring permits should be rewritten for different events

Communication from Public

Name: Cheryl Holtzman

Date Submitted: 02/15/2020 12:07 PM

Council File No: 16-1357

Comments for Public Posting: This bill is unethical in the respect that it will take away animal education from those who cannot afford it. Too many kids are not learning enough about wildlife and the responsibility to respect and protect it. People who cannot afford to visit a zoo or sanctuary will be missing the opportunity to appreciate wildlife in person and create empathy. This bill also endangers the livelihood of many businesses who would not be able to care for their animals without the income from their programs. This will put animals in danger, and put businesses and their employees in danger of economic crisis.

Communication from Public

Name: Cindi Cavallini

Date Submitted: 02/15/2020 12:10 PM

Council File No: 16-1357

Comments for Public Posting: I oppose this ordinance in its current form as the language is too broad and restrictive and will adversely affect education and conservation efforts. The language is far different from its original form and I feel the ordinance has lost sight of the original purpose.



February 12, 2020

Cindi Cavallini

Dear Councilmembers,

Opposition to agenda item #16-1357 : Please include this letter into public record to be included in any hearing, studies, and or reports pertaining to this issue.

My name is Cindi Cavallini and I have worked with exotic and domestic animals for more than 30 years. I currently own an organization that specializes in educational outreach, bringing animals to offsite locations, such as schools, libraries and birthday party visits. I can tell you with absolute certainty that the impact I have on conservation by providing the programs that I do is incomparable to anything these children would experience anywhere else. Regardless of the venue, be it at a school, library, festival or backyard birthday party our conservation message is always the same. There are times when there is amplified music or parents having a glass of wine together during my programs. In fact I have a sip and sketch program where alcohol is served and adults paint an animal model on canvas. All of these opportunities would be eliminated as this ordinance is written in its current form. These are not raucous or out of control parties in any way, but the way this ordinance is written they would be classified and banned in the same category. I provide a safe, up close and hands on opportunity for children to experience and learn about exotic animals that they would not experience otherwise.

By outlawing our ability to visit the locations we visit and lumping us together with any fly by night animal owner is unfair. This ordinance would put up roadblocks in our ability to teach and promote our conservation message that we provide to thousands of students and library patrons every year.

I urge you not to accept at face value the mischaracterizations of this proposed ordinance that will limit our ability to instill the lifetime of respect and caring we provide to children and adults alike, who meet our animals every day. Please take the time to learn about what this ordinance will do to education and outreach from the professionals, they are more than happy to meet and talk to each one of you.

Sincerely,
Cindi Cavallini

Owner/Educator at All About Animals, LLC
Professional member of Zoological Association of America
Professional member of American Association of Zoo Keepers
Co-chair of Animal Welfare Committee for Circus Fans of American
American Association of Zoo Keepers International Outreach Committee member
Graduate of Moorpark College Institute for Wild and Exotic Animal Studies

Communication from Public

Name: D. Lee

Date Submitted: 02/15/2020 02:08 PM

Council File No: 16-1357

Comments for Public Posting: Thank you for reviewing this. Please know that this ordinance is flawed and harmful to valuable businesses in our community. It doesn't give exemptions for filming; its definition of a performing animal show is flawed and as such if permitted to be passed would destroy opportunities to teach, inform and educate. Conservation and education about animals is critical to human existence. Although well-intended (stopping abuse and disreputable animal trainers and practices like circuses) this ordinance will shut down the good guys - and they ARE out there: those who by example show how amazing these creatures are in real life, not just in CGI. This over-corrects so much that it will stop educational programs that use wildlife. PLEASE do not allow this to pass. It is a bad bill designed for headlines, not for a cure. Thank you.

Communication from Public

Name: Jennifer

Date Submitted: 02/15/2020 02:41 PM

Council File No: 16-1357

Comments for Public Posting: As an Animal Care Professional that focuses on Outreach and Education and that travels to the areas affected by this ordinance, I oppose the ordinance as written. The vagueness in definition of Dangerous Animal is concerning and broadly left to immense interpretation. It could be interpreted to include those outside the listed species per-say a skunk or even an opossum. There is no correlation that alcohol being present at events decreases the ability or effectiveness of wildlife education and conservation. Including that language would eliminate many opportunities to complete many Animal Care professionals' mission, to educate & inspire others to action and to conserve our world. A permitting process of this nature is not the way to ensure animal or human safety. In the case of Education and Conservation it would only severely limit the demographic and audiences we could reach by creating monetary barriers. In today's world children can identify 10 logos and brands yet cannot identify 10 animal or plant species in their own backyard. The current language of this ordinance would do nothing to help aid; yet only severely eliminate the ability of USDA and CA Fish & Wildlife permitted Professionals to educate and promote conservation of our natural world. Something that is vital to all that share this planet.

Communication from Public

Name: Nerissa Politzer

Date Submitted: 02/15/2020 03:39 PM

Council File No: 16-1357

Comments for Public Posting: I oppose the ordinance for the following reasons: 1. No Exemption for Filming 2. Performing Animal Show definition must be changed. 3. Conservation and Education are vital to our existence with beautiful animals in our world.

Communication from Public

Name: jackie navarro
Date Submitted: 02/15/2020 03:45 PM
Council File No: 16-1357
Comments for Public Posting: please see attached letter Jackie Navarro

Feb 14,2020

Dear Los Angeles City Council Members,

Please accept this letter as public record I OPPOSE the wild,exotic, and dangerous animal ordinance in its current draft and ask that you please consider delaying your vote on this matter until further explored with all of the negative repercussions that will occur to your constituents as well as large NGOs that come into the city and spend large amounts of money.

My name is Jackie Navarro. I am the executive director of Wild Wonders. Our mission is to rescue, educate and conserve. We present environmental outreach programs throughout Southern California including Los Angeles and reach thousands of school age children annually. I am an Environmental and Systematic(wildlife) biologist by degree and my organization is accredited by the Zoological Association of America. I was past president of the Association of Professional Wildlife Educators and have been active in conservation work since 1991 when I left the world renowned San Diego Zoo.

I was disappointed with my conversation with Justin from Mr Ryus office on Friday at the lack of thoughtfulness and ramifications this current draft proposes. With just a few minor changes, we can wholeheartedly support this ordinance as we all want animals treated humanely. The definition of animal .performance “for the benefit of a live audience” encompasses every outreach program we do!

A larger issue is no amplified music or alcohol-im not sure how many benefits for conservation projects you have been to, but ALL serve spirits and fine dining to their donators. This virtually means Dr Laurie Marker, world renowned cheetah conservationist can no longer hold fundraisers with our ambassador cheetah in Los Angeles or Steve Irwins

foundation , Wildlife Warriors can no longer have Australian ambassador animals at their very popular event in Los Angeles.

It means our Roots and Shoots appearances in the past with Dr Jane Goodall will be illegal as they had amplified music-I can go on and on with the large conservation organizations that will be affected in their fundraising efforts by not being allowed to have ambassador animals at these events if there is alcohol or amplified music. Please reconsider and delay this vote. I am also attaching a mark out for you to look at.

Thank You

Sincerely

Jackie Navarro

Wild Wonders

Communication from Public

Name: jackie navarro
Date Submitted: 02/15/2020 03:47 PM
Council File No: 16-1357
Comments for Public Posting: recommended markup attached

LA ORDINANCE – MARK UP 2/13/2020 CS

ORDINANCE NO. _____

An ordinance adding Section 53.39.1 to the Los Angeles Municipal Code to regulate the exhibition of a wild, exotic, or dangerous animal in the City, and amending Section 53.50 to update animal permit regulations.

WHEREAS, a wild, exotic, and dangerous animal should be protected from cruel or inhumane treatment and the exhibition of a wild or exotic animal or a dangerous animal should be strictly regulated and limited to situations involving a public benefit;

WHEREAS, the City has a compelling interest in ensuring the safety of animals and the public by restricting the circumstances in which a wild, exotic, or dangerous animal may be exhibited;

WHEREAS, the purpose of this ordinance is to prohibit performing animal shows, and to limit the off-site exhibition of a wild, exotic, or dangerous animal to a conservation or educational presentation or for filming;

WHEREAS, any person who operates a business that involves keeping or exhibiting a wild, exotic, or dangerous animal on site is required to obtain a permit pursuant to Section 53.50 of this Code;

WHEREAS, Section 53.39.1 is added to protect the safety of the public when a person exhibits a wild, exotic, or dangerous animal off-site from the location authorized by the permit issued under Section 53.50; and

WHEREAS, Section 53.50 is amended to make it consistent with Section 53.39.1 by deleting permits for a circus or an alligator or ostrich farm.

NOW, THEREFORE,

THE PEOPLE OF THE CITY OF LOS ANGELES DO ORDAIN AS FOLLOWS:

Section 1. Section 53.39.1 is added to Article 3, Chapter V of the Los Angeles Municipal Code to read as follows:

SEC. 53.39.1. WILD OR EXOTIC ANIMAL - EXHIBITION.

(a) **Definitions.**

- 1. Circus or Performing Animal Show.** An exhibition in which a Wild or Exotic Animal or Dangerous Animal is required to perform tricks, give rides, or participate as accompaniment for the entertainment, and amusement, ~~or of benefit of a live audience,~~ **outside the scope and definition of education and conservation per this ordinance.** ~~whether or not a fee is charged.~~

- 2. Conservation or Educational Presentation.** A presentation by a Zoo, wildlife conservation center, qualified professional animal handler, educator, or scientist pursuant to a permit issued by the Department in accordance with this section that includes a Wild or Exotic Animal or a Dangerous Animal, the purpose of which is to educate and teach respect and responsible behavior for the conservation and protection of wildlife and the environment, animal behavior, habitat, and life cycle, as well as the humane treatment of Wild or Exotic Animals and Dangerous Animals. ~~A presentation with a Wild or Exotic Animal or with a Dangerous Animal is not permitted in any location with amplified music, where alcohol is available, or where the Wild or Exotic Animal or Dangerous Animal is to perform tricks or behaviors that does not naturally occur in the wild for that animal.~~

Does not belong in “definitions” ... Regardless, the definition of amplified music includes MANY truly conservation and education events, to include background music throughout at an event. Further, Wine is served at many if not most of these events, some very high-end and very beneficial to conservation efforts. Although we fully understand the intent, to define an unruly “house party”, this language, “to the letter”, will afford extremists the ability to accuse all animal related events to be in violation of this language.

Many zoos host very extravagant annual galas and fundraising events, on and off-site, that entertain their donors and guests with amplified music, fine dining and spirits. This language, to the letter, would unintentionally prohibit such or beg one to question the difference between on and/or off-site to the animals or the public attending. It is simply unnecessary as the definition of conservation and education within the permit process will in itself define and eliminate the very “house parties” we all agree are the true target.

- 3. Dangerous Animal.** A Wild or Exotic Animal belonging to, but not limited to, the mammalian, amphibian, or reptilian families that is potentially dangerous by nature as a species and poses an inherent risk of harm to human health or safety because of its strength, size, physical characteristics, instinctual behavior or risk of disease transmission, including, but not limited to, Order Felidae: Panthera (lions, tigers, leopards, jaguars), mountain lions, cheetahs, and any hybrid thereof, Order Carnivora (Canidae: Wolves, Ursidae: Bears, Hyaenidae: Hyena), elephant, hippopotamus, rhinoceros, moose, bison, giraffe, and certain nonhuman primates such as a gorilla, chimpanzee, orangutan, baboon, macaque, as well as non-venomous reptiles over 8 feet in length, and venomous reptiles.
- 4. Filming.** Filming pursuant to a City film permit, and a permit to film with animals issued by the Department pursuant to Section 53.50 of this Code.
- 5. 5. Wild or Exotic Animal.** An animal of a non-domesticated order or family, whether the animal was bred in the wild or in captivity, and any hybrid of a Wild or Exotic animal belonging to, but not limited to, the mammalian, amphibian, or reptilian families and any hybrid thereof **that is potentially dangerous by nature as a species and poses an inherent risk of harm to human health or safety because of its strength, size, physical characteristics, instinctual behavior or risk of disease transmission.**
- 6. Zoo.** An entity that exhibits a Wild or Exotic Animal and possesses the requisite permits from the United States Department of Agriculture, the United States Department of Fish & Wildlife, the California Department of Fish & Wildlife, and all other required City, State, and Federal permits.

(b) **Exhibition of a Wild or Exotic Animal or Dangerous Animal.** It shall be unlawful for any person to exhibit a Wild or Exotic Animal or Dangerous Animal beyond the location specified in a permit issued pursuant to Section 53.50 of this Code, except in compliance with an off-site exhibition permit authorized by this section, available only for Filming or a Conservation or Educational Presentation. Public contact with a Dangerous Animal in connection with a Conservation or Educational Presentation is prohibited.

(c) **Permit Application.** A permit issued by the Department shall be required for the off-site exhibition of a Wild or Exotic Animal or a Dangerous Animal. The application shall include the following:

1. The applicant shall provide a copy of all required Federal, State, and local permits, including, if applicable, a film permit or an animal rental permit.
2. The applicant shall describe the safeguards for the humane treatment and safe transportation of each animal and for the safety of the public.
3. The applicant shall attest that each animal owner, handler, and anyone connected with or responsible for the exhibition of the Wild or Exotic Animal or Dangerous Animal has not been convicted of animal abuse, neglect, or cruelty.
4. If applicable, the applicant shall provide the names and contact information for the owner and/or the rental company from which each Wild or Exotic Animal or Dangerous Animal was obtained.
5. For Filming, the applicant also shall provide the Department with a copy of the City film permit; a copy of the Department film permit issued pursuant to Section 53.50; the date, time, and location of the Filming; the age, type, and number of Wild or Exotic Animals and Dangerous Animals; and a description of the scenes where the Wild or Exotic Animal and/or Dangerous Animal will be used.
6. For a Conservation or Educational Presentation that includes a Dangerous Animal, the applicant also shall provide the Department with the date time, location, and purpose of the exhibition; the age, type, and number of Dangerous Animals to be exhibited; and the age, type and number of any other animals present. The applicant shall submit the completed application at least ten calendar days prior to the Conservation or Educational Presentation. Upon good cause, the Department may approve an application submitted within fewer days.
7. The applicant shall provide proof of insurance in an amount and form acceptable to the City's risk manager.
8. The applicant shall provide any additional information requested by the Department, including, but not limited to, information requested by the Department following the Department's consultation with governmental agencies, such as the Los Angeles Police Department, the Los Angeles Fire Department, federal or state agencies.

(d) **Permit Duration.** The Department may issue an annual off-site permit pursuant to this section for a Conservation or Educational Presentation that does not include a Dangerous Animal. A permit for an off-site Conservation or Educational

Presentation with a Dangerous Animal shall be limited to the date, time, and location of the Conservation or Educational Presentation. A filming permit issued by the Department for Filming shall be limited to the date, time, and location of the scenes involving the Wild or Exotic Animal or Dangerous Animal.

(e) **Prohibition - Circus or Performing Animal show.** No person shall exhibit, and the Department shall not issue a permit for, a Wild or Exotic Animal or Dangerous Animal in connection with a Circus or a Performing Animal Show **outside the scope and definition of education and conservation per this ordinance.**

- (f) **Prohibition - Loud or Unruly Gathering.** No person shall exhibit a Wild or Exotic Animal or a Dangerous Animal for, or in conjunction with, a house party or loud or unruly gathering as defined in Section 41.58.1 of this Code. The Department shall not issue a permit under this section to any person who in the prior two years has been convicted, pleaded no contest, failed to appear, or forfeited bail in connection with a violation of Section 41.58.1. The Department shall not issue a permit under this section for the exhibition of a Wild or Exotic Animal or Dangerous Animal on any property used in the last two years for, or in conjunction with, a house party or loud or unruly gathering as defined in Section 41.58.1.
- (g) **Rules and Regulations.** The General Manager may promulgate additional definitions, rules, and regulations necessary to carry out the intent and purpose of this article.

Sec. 2. Subsection (a) of Section 53.50 to Article 3, Chapter V of the Los Angeles Municipal Code is amended to read as follows:

(a) Permit Requirements.

1. It shall be unlawful for any person, without first obtaining a permit from the Department pursuant to this section, to operate or conduct a business or enterprise in the City of Los Angeles that involves keeping or exhibiting animals, including, but not limited to, a dog kennel, cat kennel, pet shop, Zoo, wildlife conservation center, animal rental establishment, animal grooming parlor, riding academy, livery stable, boarding stable, pony ring or pony ride, horse market, mule market, rodeo, pet show, cat show, animal acts or exhibitions, wild animals, miscellaneous animal or reptile establishment, or carrier and homing pigeons which are to be liberated for exercise or racing. A permit obtained under this section does not allow the permit holder to exhibit a wild, exotic or Dangerous Animal anywhere except on the permitted premises, unless the permit is issued in compliance with Section 53.39.1 of this Code.
2. It shall be unlawful for any person to engage in Filming with an animal in the City of Los Angeles without first obtaining a permit from the Department pursuant to this section. If the Filming involves use of a wild, exotic or Dangerous Animal, it shall be unlawful to engage in Filming without obtaining a permit issued in compliance with Section 53.39.1 of this Code.
3. No permit shall be available and it shall be unlawful for any person to keep, conduct, or operate within the City of Los Angeles any Circus or performing acts using wild, exotic or Dangerous Animals.

Sec. 3. Subsection (f) of Section 53.50 to Article 3, Chapter V of the Los Angeles Municipal Code is amended to read as follows:

(f) **Permit Fees.** The Department, before receiving any application for granting of any permit required by this section, shall require the payment of a Permit Fee of the type and in the amount set forth in this section as follows, or as revised in the manner set forth in Subsection (a) of Section 53.12 or other sections of this article:

1. Dog Kennel....\$305.00

2. Cat Kennel....\$290.00
3. Pet Shop....\$290.00
4. Zoo....\$220.00
5. Animal Rental Establishment....\$290.00
6. Pet Show, Dog Show....\$425.00
7. Miscellaneous Animal or Reptile Establishment....\$205.00
8. Rodeo....\$1,660.00
9. Homing Pigeons....\$290.00
10. Riding Academy, Livery Stable, Board Stable, Pony Ride, Horse Market or Mule Market....\$325.00
11. Animal Grooming Parlor....\$180.00
12. Filming with Animals....\$680.00
13. Keeping Wild Animals....\$290.00
14. Animal Acts or Exhibitions....\$425.00

The fees imposed herein for a pet show or a dog show shall be waived if the show is held in a public park.

Sec 4. **Severability.** If any provision of this ordinance is found to be unconstitutional or otherwise invalid by any court of competent jurisdiction, that invalidity shall not affect the remaining provisions of this ordinance that can be implemented without the invalid provisions and, to this end, the provisions of this ordinance are declared to be severable. The City Council hereby declares that it would have adopted this ordinance and each provision thereof irrespective of whether any one or more provisions are found invalid, unconstitutional or otherwise unenforceable.

Sec. 5. The City Clerk shall certify to the passage of this ordinance and have it published in accordance with Council policy, either in a daily newspaper circulated in the City of Los Angeles or by posting for ten days in three public places in the City of Los Angeles: one copy on the bulletin board located at the Main Street entrance to the Los Angeles City Hall; one copy on the bulletin board located at the Main Street entrance to the Los Angeles City Hall East; and one copy on the bulletin board located at the Temple Street entrance to the Los Angeles County Hall of Records.

Communication from Public

Name: Mark Forbes

Date Submitted: 02/15/2020 03:48 PM

Council File No: 16-1357

Comments for Public Posting: Please rethink the ordinance as it is currently written. As is, there are too many non planned results that will be detrimental to the animal educational programs meant to help the very animals it is meant to protect. The definition of a performing animal show: any animal that participates as accompaniment for the benefit of a live audience. That is too wide a description, It would include every program we do with live animals educational or not. Filming is not exempted in this ordinance 4. Wild/Exotic Animals are all grouped at the same level as Dangerous Animals. This is not accurate.!

Communication from Public

Name: MaryEllen Schoeman

Date Submitted: 02/15/2020 06:47 PM

Council File No: 16-1357

Comments for Public Posting: This ordinance would severely impact the ability of conservation and educational organizations to teach people about animals and environmental issues. Animal ambassadors frequently appear at events where wine is served, for instance. Educational organizations may take animals to an elementary school age child's birthday party where there may be music. Further, contact with a non-venomous large snake is not dangerous if the animal is handled properly. This ordinance would prevent thousands of children from experiencing the wonder of seeing and touching animals.

Communication from Public

Name: K Halsey

Date Submitted: 02/15/2020 08:47 PM

Council File No: 16-1357

Comments for Public Posting: I oppose the ordinance as it is currently written: 'No Exemption for Filming' The performing Animal Show definition must be changed, and conservation and education are necessary for continued efforts to promote awareness about animals. There has been new language added to this ordinance that would greatly harm these conservation and education efforts, and to many of your constituents and their businesses that spend a large amount of money within the City of Los Angeles. This will literally devastate the efforts of professional animal handlers to educate the greater population of Los Angeles.