



Carolina Peters <carolina.peters@lacity.org>

## Fwd: Free Billy the Elephant to a Sanctuary

1 message

**Staci Roberts** <staci.roberts@lacity.org>  
To: Carolina Peters <carolina.peters@lacity.org>

Wed, May 31, 2017 at 7:21 AM

Carol,

Here are more public comments regarding Billy the elephant, attach to CF 17-0453.

Thanks

----- Forwarded message -----

From: **Eric (Roderico) Villanueva** <eric.villanueva@lacity.org>  
Date: Tue, May 30, 2017 at 9:28 AM  
Subject: Fwd: Free Billy the Elephant to a Sanctuary  
To: Staci Roberts <staci.roberts@lacity.org>

5-12-17

*Eric Villanueva*  
*Office of the City Clerk*  
*200 N. Spring St. Rm. 395*  
*Los Angeles, CA 90012*  
*213-978-1075*



----- Forwarded message -----

From: **Kenny Floyd** <kendebfloyd@gmail.com>  
Date: Fri, May 12, 2017 at 6:46 PM  
Subject: Free Billy the Elephant to a Sanctuary  
To: paul.koretz@lacity.org, councilmember.price@lacity.org, councilmember.blumenfield@lacity.org, david.ryu@lacity.org  
Cc: Clerk.CPS@lacity.org, Eric.Villanueva@lacity.org

Dear LA Councilmembers:

I am writing on behalf of Billy the elephant at the Los Angeles Zoo. He has lived there for nearly 30 years, since he was taken as a youngster from his natural environment in Malaysia. For most of this time, he has endured living all by himself in an extremely tiny enclosure. Even though the Elephant exhibit was supposedly enlarged and promises were made for better care for Billy and the other elephants, he is still exhibiting stress-related behavior -- swaying, rocking and head-bobbing. He appears miserable, bored, frustrated and depressed.

Please release Billy — and these other elephants --- to a sanctuary. The elephant exhibit at the Los Angeles Zoo needs to be shut down and the elephants retired to a sanctuary where they can live out the remainder of their lives where their needs will be met more appropriately.

Billy deserves this.

5/31/2017

City of Los Angeles Mail - Fwd: Free Billy the Elephant to a Sanctuary

Please vote to free Billy from his life of restriction at the zoo and to transfer him to a sanctuary where he can live the remainder of his life in peace in a more normal setting.

Respectfully,

Debra S. Floyd



Carolina Peters &lt;carolina.peters@lacity.org&gt;

---

**Fwd: Billy the elephant**

1 message

---

**Staci Roberts** <staci.roberts@lacity.org>  
To: Carolina Peters <carolina.peters@lacity.org>

Wed, May 31, 2017 at 7:21 AM

----- Forwarded message -----

From: **Eric (Roderico) Villanueva** <eric.villanueva@lacity.org>  
Date: Tue, May 30, 2017 at 9:29 AM  
Subject: Fwd: Billy the elephant  
To: Staci Roberts <staci.roberts@lacity.org>

5-13-17

*Eric Villanueva*  
*Office of the City Clerk*  
*200 N. Spring St. Rm. 395*  
*Los Angeles, CA 90012*  
*213-978-1075*



----- Forwarded message -----

From: <FenAnnie@aol.com>  
Date: Sat, May 13, 2017 at 2:22 PM  
Subject: Billy the elephant  
To: paul.koretz@lacity.org, councilmember.ofarrell@lacity.org, councilmember.price@lacity.org,  
councilmember.blumenfield@lacity.org, david.ryu@lacity.org  
Cc: Clerk.CPS@lacity.org, Eric.Villanueva@lacity.org

Dear Council Members:

I am writing to urge to vote to pass the resolution before the City Council to release Billy the elephant to a reputable sanctuary.

Sincerely,

Charlene Cooper  
Poestenkill, New York 12140



Carolina Peters <carolina.peters@lacity.org>

## Fwd: Release Billy the Elephant to sanctuary

1 message

**Staci Roberts** <staci.roberts@lacity.org>  
To: Carolina Peters <carolina.peters@lacity.org>

Wed, May 31, 2017 at 7:22 AM

----- Forwarded message -----

From: **Eric (Roderico) Villanueva** <eric.villanueva@lacity.org>  
Date: Tue, May 30, 2017 at 9:31 AM  
Subject: Fwd: Release Billy the Elephant to sanctuary  
To: Staci Roberts <staci.roberts@lacity.org>

5-16-17

*Eric Villanueva*  
*Office of the City Clerk*  
*200 N. Spring St. Rm. 395*  
*Los Angeles, CA 90012*  
*213-978-1075*



----- Forwarded message -----

From: **Lesley Hudak** <elevenlights@hotmail.com>  
Date: Tue, May 16, 2017 at 3:39 AM  
Subject: Release Billy the Elephant to sanctuary  
To: "paul.koretz@lacity.org" <paul.koretz@lacity.org>, "councilmember.ofarrell@lacity.org" <councilmember.ofarrell@lacity.org>, "councilmember.price@lacity.org" <councilmember.price@lacity.org>, "councilmember.blumenfield@lacity.org" <councilmember.blumenfield@lacity.org>, "david.ryu@lacity.org" <david.ryu@lacity.org>  
Cc: "Clerk.CPS@lacity.org" <Clerk.CPS@lacity.org>, "Eric.Villanueva@lacity.org" <Eric.Villanueva@lacity.org>

Dear Councilmembers,

I urge you to vote in favor of the resolution to send Billy the L.A. zoo elephant to sanctuary. No animal including Billy should be forced to live in such an unhealthy and isolated environment.

This is the right thing to do and will send a strong message promoting our duty to provide for the wellbeing of all animals in our care.



5/31/2017

City of Los Angeles Mail - Fwd: Release Billy the Elephant to sanctuary

Sincerely,

Lesley Hudak

Orinda, CA



Carolina Peters &lt;carolina.peters@lacity.org&gt;

## Fwd: Objection to Paul Koretz's Motion to Remove Billy the Elephant from the Los Angeles Zoo

1 message

**Staci Roberts** <staci.roberts@lacity.org>  
To: Carolina Peters <carolina.peters@lacity.org>

Wed, May 31, 2017 at 7:22 AM

----- Forwarded message -----

From: **Eric (Roderico) Villanueva** <eric.villanueva@lacity.org>  
Date: Tue, May 30, 2017 at 9:32 AM  
Subject: Fwd: Objection to Paul Koretz's Motion to Remove Billy the Elephant from the Los Angeles Zoo  
To: Staci Roberts <staci.roberts@lacity.org>

5-16-17

*Eric Villanueva*  
*Office of the City Clerk*  
*200 N. Spring St. Rm. 395*  
*Los Angeles, CA 90012*  
*213-978-1075*



----- Forwarded message -----

From: **John Stimson** <johnstimson@yahoo.com>  
Date: Tue, May 16, 2017 at 1:46 PM  
Subject: Objection to Paul Koretz's Motion to Remove Billy the Elephant from the Los Angeles Zoo  
To: "Eric.Villanueva@lacity.org" <Eric.Villanueva@lacity.org>

Dear Eric Villanueva,

It is my understanding that comments regarding city council business be directed to you. I offer this letter for yours and the city council's consideration.

I am the founder and chief counsel for Elephant Advocates, a legal and conservation foundation that intervenes on behalf of captive elephants. I have personally observed Billy the elephas maximus bull at the Los Angeles. I am also a longtime resident of the city of Los Angeles.

Councilman Koretz's Motion is filled with inaccurate generalities, misstatements, hyperbole and is actually an indictment of how the city may have failed the zoo.

The Motion is filled with a multitude of conclusory statements. The Motion states that Billy has spent much of his time in less than optimal conditions, but does not suggest what an optimal setting should be and only provides a description of the old elephant enclosure that had to have been described to him. Certainly, it would be nice if the elephant enclosure had more acreage, but the Motion seems to forget that the zoo only has a finite set of acreage. I remember being told when the Elephants of Asia opened that the soil used for the entire elephant enclosure was river bottom sand, a material that does not compact so it should not harden.

The Motion cites that "Elephants in zoos breed poorly or not at all." Empirically, that is a false statement. I travel to numerous zoos yearly and have witnessed several news calves in the past few years. Elephant gestation is about 23 months and then the mother usually does not mate until after the calf is weaned, about four years later, so there are several years between births. I do know of captive calves that did not survive. In the wild, 20% of calves do not make to the first birthday. Asian elephants are endangered, because of ivory poaching and a rapidly decreasing habitat.

Zoos provide a home for retired (thankfully) circus elephants, like Tina and Jewel. Zoos provide a means for an endangered species like Asian elephants to procreate. The Motion mentions the artificial procreation methods to gather semen from Billy, if Billy were to have one or two breeding age cows he could produce offspring naturally, which would also provide Billy with companionship. The unintended consequence of the activism against Billy and the lawsuits is that those acts are the cause of a social animal like Billy for being alone. People like Councilman Koretz, and those who share his mindset, are the reason why the zoo must be reluctant to bring in breeding age cows or even another male for Billy to interact and socialize with.

Billy is special. Billy is magnificent. At 14,000 pounds, Billy is the second largest bull in the Western Hemisphere. At 32 years old he is in prime breeding age. The elephant species gene pool is being deprived of Billy's genes because activists have made it impossible for Billy to mate at the Los Angeles Zoo. Billy will not get to mate at a sanctuary. Cows at sanctuaries are usually past breeding age, and usually have health conditions and issues because of years of previous mistreatment.

I have seen first hand the bond that Billy has with the elephant staff at the zoo. Elephants do form bonds with human who provide care for them, which Billy, Tina and Jewel certainly exhibit. As sentient creatures elephants do experience loss. The Los Angeles Zoo has been Billy's home since he was four years old. The staff are his family. Removing Billy from the zoo would be stripping him from his family.

Most sanctuaries do not take bulls. The activists that appear to have Councilman Koretz's ear seem to want to send Billy to PAWS. As a private institution, information about PAWS is guarded. But it has a checkered past. An elephant died in a fire in a barn or a trailer. It is claimed that Tuberculosis has been spread to elephants from staff. Ruby, the elephant from the Los Angeles Zoo transferred to PAWS died four years later. She appeared quite healthy in the YouTube videos I watched of her at PAWS. I would like to know the circumstances of her demise. Shouldn't the City Council know also before it even votes on the motion?

Moving Billy to PAWS would cause him distress. It could possibly be detrimental to his health.

Sanctuaries do not have access to excellent quality veterinary care that a major zoo provides. And if the Los Angeles Zoo does not have the best veterinary care possible then that is the direct fault of the people who run and manage this city.

As I stated, I run a foundation that's only interest is the well-being and best interests of captive elephants (along with awareness of the plight of elephants worldwide), I also provide legal counsel for an orangutan foundation, if it were best for Billy to be moved I would be championing such an act. But that is not the case here. It is in Billy's best interest not to be sent to a place like PAWS. That would be a purely ideological and political act. I am not sure how people who want to move Billy really think about Billy as a living being. Have they ever stood next to Billy, looked in his eyes, and seen that there is a being more capable than even us humans? I've watched Billy watch me, study me. I felt blessed by the awareness. People need to look objectively to determine the elephant's needs for itself, not their needs for the elephant (which is what the motion in question aims to do).

I have clinically and objectively observed Billy for nine years (I have the photos to prove it), heck, I have formed a bond with him and I want what's best for him. This Motion is not what is best for this individual elephant.

If there are issues that are problematic with the zoo, then the city council should specifically remedy those issues, that is the council's duty.

I plead with the city council not to approve the motion to relocate Billy.

I also plead that the council not cancel any future breeding activities at the zoo. Human beings owe a duty of stewardship to this planet, especially to the animals on it, and we should be doing everything to insure the survival of endangered species like Asian elephants.

Respectfully,

John P. Stimson, Esq.  
Chief Counsel, Elephant Advocates  
Sherman Oaks, CA  
(818) 905-9246



Carolina Peters &lt;carolina.peters@lacity.org&gt;

---

**Fwd: Please send Billy the elephant to an accredited sanctuary**

1 message

---

**Staci Roberts** <staci.roberts@lacity.org>  
To: Carolina Peters <carolina.peters@lacity.org>

Wed, May 31, 2017 at 7:22 AM

----- Forwarded message -----

From: **Eric (Roderico) Villanueva** <eric.villanueva@lacity.org>  
Date: Tue, May 30, 2017 at 9:32 AM  
Subject: Fwd: Please send Billy the elephant to an accredited sanctuary  
To: Staci Roberts <staci.roberts@lacity.org>

5-16-17

*Eric Villanueva*  
*Office of the City Clerk*  
*200 N. Spring St. Rm. 395*  
*Los Angeles, CA 90012*  
*213-978-1075*



----- Forwarded message -----

From: **Natalie Ryan** <natalie.r.ryan@gmail.com>  
Date: Tue, May 16, 2017 at 2:08 PM  
Subject: Please send Billy the elephant to an accredited sanctuary  
To: paul.koretz@lacity.org, councilmember.ofarrell@lacity.org, councilmember.price@lacity.org,  
councilmember.blumenfield@lacity.org, david.ryu@lacity.org  
Cc: Clerk.CPS@lacity.org, Eric.Villanueva@lacity.org

I am writing to you because I recently signed a petition begun by Karen Eisenlord on care2. Billy needs to be placed in an accredited elephant sanctuary because he is displaying severe signs of stress in his present environment. Elephants are highly intelligent and social animals and Billy does not seem to be engaged by his surroundings, a condition that is necessary for an elephant's well-being. Keeping animals without considering their well-being is a barbaric behavior that belongs in the Middle Ages. Please consider the well-being of Billy before the L.A. Zoo's profits.

Thank you for your consideration,  
Natalie Ryan



Carolina Peters <carolina.peters@lacity.org>

## Fwd: Free Billy the Elephant

1 message

**Staci Roberts** <staci.roberts@lacity.org>  
To: Carolina Peters <carolina.peters@lacity.org>

Wed, May 31, 2017 at 7:23 AM

----- Forwarded message -----

From: **Eric (Roderico) Villanueva** <eric.villanueva@lacity.org>  
Date: Tue, May 30, 2017 at 9:33 AM  
Subject: Fwd: Free Billy the Elephant  
To: Staci Roberts <staci.roberts@lacity.org>

5-18-17

*Eric Villanueva*  
*Office of the City Clerk*  
*200 N. Spring St. Rm. 395*  
*Los Angeles, CA 90012*  
*213-978-1075*



----- Forwarded message -----

From: **Cristian Contreras** <cris006@sbcglobal.net>  
Date: Thu, May 18, 2017 at 9:02 PM  
Subject: Free Billy the Elephant  
To: "paul.koretz@lacity.org" <paul.koretz@lacity.org>, "councilmember.ofarrell@lacity.org" <councilmember.ofarrell@lacity.org>, "councilmember.price@lacity.org" <councilmember.price@lacity.org>, "councilmember.blumenfield@lacity.org" <councilmember.blumenfield@lacity.org>, "david.ryu@lacity.org" <david.ryu@lacity.org>  
Cc: "Clerk.CPS@lacity.org" <Clerk.CPS@lacity.org>, "Eric.Villanueva@lacity.org" <Eric.Villanueva@lacity.org>

Hello, I am contacting you today to urge you to please allow Billy the elephant to be sent to a sanctuary

Other elephants at the LA Zoo have died prematurely due to conditions elephants often acquire while living in enclosed and cramped quarters. In addition, Billy is being kept alone, which is heartbreaking. Elephants are highly social animals and poor Billy is all by himself, he deserves much better. Please do the right thing and ensure Billy can live a long, happy life in a place more closely resembling his natural habitat with lots of other elephants to grow old with. Thank you

Cristian Contreras





Carolina Peters <carolina.peters@lacity.org>

## Fwd: Los Angeles Zoo promised to close down the old elephant exhibit and build a bigger

1 message

**Staci Roberts** <staci.roberts@lacity.org>  
To: Carolina Peters <carolina.peters@lacity.org>

Wed, May 31, 2017 at 7:23 AM

----- Forwarded message -----

From: **Eric (Roderico) Villanueva** <eric.villanueva@lacity.org>  
Date: Tue, May 30, 2017 at 9:34 AM  
Subject: Fwd: Los Angeles Zoo promised to close down the old elephant exhibit and build a bigger  
To: Staci Roberts <staci.roberts@lacity.org>

5-19-17

*Eric Villanueva*  
*Office of the City Clerk*  
*200 N. Spring St. Rm. 395*  
*Los Angeles, CA 90012*  
*213-978-1075*



----- Forwarded message -----

From: **Kali Zulu** <kalizulu@icloud.com>  
Date: Fri, May 19, 2017 at 1:17 AM  
Subject: Los Angeles Zoo promised to close down the old elephant exhibit and build a bigger  
To: councilmember.cedillo@lacity.org, councilmember.krekorian@lacity.org, councilmember.blumenfield@lacity.org, councilmember.martinez@lacity.org, councilmember.fuentes@lacity.org, councilmember.harris-dawson@lacity.org, councilmember.price@lacity.org, councilmember.englander@lacity.org, councilmember.ofarrell@lacity.org, councilmember.huizar@lacity.org, councildistrict15@lacity.org, councilmember.buscaino@lacity.org, mayor.garcetti@lacity.org  
Cc: Clerk.CPS@lacity.org, Eric.Villanueva@lacity.org

Dear LA Zoo Director, Mayor of Los Angeles, LA City Council Members:

I am concerned about Billy the elephant. He has lived at the Los Angeles Zoo for almost 30 years, in an enclosure that does not mimic his natural environment and without other elephants. I have been told that there has been a display of distress and that you are aware of this.

I encourage you to consider what an animal would need to find comfort, belonging and nurture (to be an elephant), when he cannot be free. Intelligent, social, inquisitive...; if given the opportunity Billy could say a lot about "Billy the Elephant" - a treasure of LA City.

Sincerely,





Carolina Peters &lt;carolina.peters@lacity.org&gt;

## Fwd: Please release Billy the Elephant to a Sanctuary

1 message

**Staci Roberts** <staci.roberts@lacity.org>  
 To: Carolina Peters <carolina.peters@lacity.org>

Wed, May 31, 2017 at 7:23 AM

----- Forwarded message -----

From: **Eric (Roderico) Villanueva** <eric.villanueva@lacity.org>  
 Date: Tue, May 30, 2017 at 9:34 AM  
 Subject: Fwd: Please release Billy the Elephant to a Sanctuary  
 To: Staci Roberts <staci.roberts@lacity.org>

5-19-17

*Eric Villanueva*  
 Office of the City Clerk  
 200 N. Spring St. Rm. 395  
 Los Angeles, CA 90012  
 213-978-1075



----- Forwarded message -----

From: **Roo Veitch** <rooveitch@gmail.com>  
 Date: Fri, May 19, 2017 at 8:13 PM  
 Subject: Please release Billy the Elephant to a Sanctuary  
 To: paul.koretz@lacity.org, councilmember.ofarrell@lacity.org, councilmember.price@lacity.org, councilmember.blumenfield@lacity.org, david.ryu@lacity.org, Clerk.CPS@lacity.org, Eric.Villanueva@lacity.org

Dear L.A. City Council Members

This is an excerpt from the petition concerning Billy the Elephant;

'Billy the elephant has lived at the Los Angeles Zoo for nearly 30 years, since he was taken as a youngster from his natural environment in Malaysia. For most of this time, he has endured living all by himself in an extremely tiny enclosure. As a result, he has displayed significant signs of stress, such as swaying and rocking side to side and head-bobbing due to frustration, boredom and possibly depression.

Elephants naturally need to roam several miles a day to maintain healthy joints and feet. They are also highly intelligent, sensitive, and social animals who need to be engaged by their surroundings in order to be happy. Billy has none of this.

The last time I saw Billy at the L.A. Zoo I was horrified to see how miserable he looks in his cramped enclosure. I am not alone in being worried that Billy will face the same fate as his predecessors at the Los Angeles Zoo, who died prematurely due to conditions elephants often acquire while living in enclosed and cramped quarters.'

It just doesn't seem right that an intelligent animal should be kept in misery for the sake of another's entertainment. It's actually pretty cruel if you think about it.

Please release Billy to a suitable sanctuary so he has a chance for a decent life in the company of people that care about him.

Yours Sincerely  
 Rupert Veitch  
 Melbourne  
 Australia



Eric (Roderico) Villanueva &lt;eric.villanueva@lacity.org&gt;

---

## Send Billy to Sanctuary and End Captive Breeding at the Los Angeles Zoo

2 messages

---

**Cheryl Levinson** <takeaction@idausa.org>  
Reply-To: Cheryl Levinson <writr@att.net>  
To: Eric Villanueva <Eric.Villanueva@lacity.org>

Wed, May 24, 2017 at 8:10 PM

May 24, 2017

Mr. Eric Villanueva

Dear Mr. Villanueva,

As a Los Angeles constituent and a supporter of California-based In Defense of Animals that represents over 250,000 supporters, I urge you to support Councilman Koretz's motion to free Billy, the lone bull elephant at the Los Angeles Zoo, to an accredited GFAS (Global Federation of Animal Sanctuaries) sanctuary as soon as possible. We also ask the same for the female elephants at the exhibit, Tina and Jewell.

Billy's plight at the LA Zoo has been a focus of In Defense of Animals for over 12 years. The inadequate conditions that he is forced to live in, despite costly renovations to the Elephants of Asia exhibit, continue to negatively impact his well-being.

Through the LA Zoo's breeding program, Billy has been forced to endure a highly invasive procedure to collect his semen for the purpose of artificially inseminating females at other zoos for breeding. According to zoo documents, Billy underwent "training" for the actual semen collection process at least 55 times between January 20, 2011 and November 14, 2014.

This procedure is inhumane and invasive. While this has been touted as a practice of "conservation," the data shows that it is nothing of the sort, with elephants in zoos dying in captivity faster than they can reproduce due to the unnaturally high mortality rates of elephants in captivity. The only real way conservation for elephants can occur is in the wild and a certified elephant sanctuary is the closest thing to a natural environment that we can give to Billy.

There is no science- or conservation-based justification for the LA Zoo to keep Billy or ANY of the elephants, including females Tina and Jewel - in captivity. The scientifically validated negative effects of captivity on elephants are irrefutable and well documented. If you've ever seen an elephant in its natural habitat, you would never want to keep it in a zoo. Please free Billy to retire in peace.

Therefore, we urge you to support the relocation of Billy to a GFAS-certified sanctuary to transfer elephants Tina and Jewel as well - end all elephant captivity and elephant breeding programs at the LA Zoo immediately.

Sincerely,

Ms. Cheryl Levinson  
11260 Overland Ave Apt 7b  
Culver City, CA 90230-5530

to support Councilman Koretz's motion to free Billy, the lone bull elephant at the Los Angeles Zoo, to an accredited GFAS (Global Federation of Animal Sanctuaries) sanctuary as soon as possible. We also ask the same for the female elephants at the exhibit, Tina and Jewell.

Billy's plight at the LA Zoo has been a focus of In Defense of Animals for over 12 years. The inadequate conditions that he is forced to live in, despite costly renovations to the Elephants of Asia exhibit, continue to negatively impact his well-being.

Through the LA Zoo's breeding program, Billy has been forced to endure a highly invasive procedure to collect his semen for the purpose of artificially inseminating females at other zoos for breeding. According to zoo documents, Billy underwent "training" for the actual semen collection process at least 55 times between January 20, 2011 and November 14, 2014.

This procedure is inhumane and invasive. While this has been touted as a practice of "conservation," the data shows that it is nothing of the sort, with elephants in zoos dying in captivity faster than they can reproduce due to the unnaturally high mortality rates of elephants in captivity. The only real way conservation for elephants can occur is in the wild and a certified elephant sanctuary is the closest thing to a natural environment that we can give to Billy.

There is no science- or conservation-based justification for the LA Zoo to keep Billy or ANY of the elephants, including females Tina and Jewel - in captivity. The scientifically validated negative effects of captivity on elephants are irrefutable and well documented. If you've ever seen an elephant in its natural habitat, you would never want to keep it in a zoo. Please free Billy to retire in peace.

Therefore, we urge you to support the relocation of Billy to a GFAS-certified sanctuary to transfer elephants Tina and Jewel as well - end all elephant captivity and elephant breeding programs at the LA Zoo immediately.

Sincerely,

Ms. Cheryl Levinson  
11260 Overland Ave Apt 7b  
Culver City, CA 90230-5530  
(310) 836-8241  
writr@att.net