

**BOARD OF  
ANIMAL SERVICES  
COMMISSIONERS**

LARRY GROSS  
PRESIDENT

OLIVIA E. GARCIA  
VICE PRESIDENT

COMMISSIONERS

ALISA FINSTEN

ROGER WOLFSON

VACANT

**City of Los Angeles**  
CALIFORNIA



**ERIC GARCETTI**  
MAYOR

**DEPARTMENT OF  
ANIMAL SERVICES**  
221 N. Figueroa Street  
6<sup>TH</sup> Floor, Suite #600  
Los Angeles, CA 90012

(888) 452-7381  
FAX (213) 482-9511

**BRENDA F. BARNETTE**  
GENERAL MANAGER

**TAMMY WATSON**  
ASSISTANT GENERAL MANAGER  
Administration

**MELISSA WEBBER**  
ASSISTANT GENERAL MANAGER  
Lifesaving

**DR. JEREMY PRUPAS**  
CHIEF VETERINARIAN

August 27, 2018

The Honorable Eric Garcetti  
Mayor, City of Los Angeles  
200 N. Spring Street, Room 303  
Los Angeles, CA 90012

The Honorable City Council  
c/o Office of the City Clerk  
City Hall, Room 395  
Los Angeles, CA 90012

Attention: Ms. Mandy Morales, Office of the Mayor

**RE: SUPPORT FOR CALIFORNIA PROPOSITION 12, FARM ANIMAL CONFINEMENT  
INITIATIVE (2018)**

Recommendation for Council Action, subject to the approval of the Mayor:

AUTHORIZE the City Council to direct the appropriate City staff to request City Lobbyists to support California Proposition 12, Farm Animal Confinement Initiative (2018).

**BACKGROUND**

At its meeting of August 14, 2018, the Board of Animal Service Commissioners (Board) voted unanimously on a motion to advise the City Council that the Board supports the passage of Proposition 12.

This ballot initiative would ban the sale of meat and eggs from calves raised for veal, breeding pigs and egg-laying hens confined in areas below a specific number of square feet. Beginning in 2020, the proposal would ban:

- Whole veal meat from a calf (young domestic cow) that was confined in an area with less than 43 square feet of usable floor space per calf;
- Whole pork meat from a breeding pig or the immediate offspring of a breeding pig that was confined in an area with less than 24 square feet of usable floor space per pig; and

"Creating a Humane LA"

AN EQUAL OPPORTUNITY EMPLOYER

Visit our website at [www.LAAnimalServices.com](http://www.LAAnimalServices.com)

SUBJECT: SUPPORT FOR CALIFORNIA PROPOSITION 12, FARM ANIMAL CONFINEMENT INITIATIVE (2018)

---

- Shell eggs and liquid eggs from an egg-laying hen (chicken, turkey, duck, goose or guinea fowl) that was confined in an area with less than 1 square foot of usable floor space per hen.

Beginning in 2021, producers would be required to confine egg-laying hens in cage-free housing systems based on the United Egg Producers' 2017 cage-free guidelines.

The ballot initiative would make the California Department of Food and Agriculture and the California Department of Public Health responsible for the measure's implementation. Violations of the initiative would be considered misdemeanors and would carry fines up to \$1,000.

A host of organizations including the Humane Society of the United States, the American Society for the Prevention of Cruelty to Animals (ASPCA), government officials and nearly 500 California veterinarians support Proposition 12.

**FISCAL IMPACT**

There is a potential of decrease in state and local tax revenues from farm businesses, likely not to exceed the low millions of dollars annually. Also, these are potential state costs ranging up to ten million dollars annually to enforce the measure.

Respectfully submitted,



Brenda F. Barnette  
General Manager

Attachments:  
Board Report – California Proposition 12, Farm Animal Confinement Initiative (2018)

cc: Megan Cottier, City Administrative Officer

**BOARD OF  
ANIMAL SERVICES  
COMMISSIONERS**

LARRY GROSS  
PRESIDENT

OLIVIA E. GARCIA  
VICE PRESIDENT

COMMISSIONERS

ALISA FINSTEN

ROGER WOLFSON

VACANT

**City of Los Angeles**

CALIFORNIA



**ERIC GARCETTI  
MAYOR**

**DEPARTMENT OF  
ANIMAL SERVICES**  
221 N. Figueroa Street  
6<sup>TH</sup> Floor, Suite #600  
Los Angeles, CA 90012

(888) 452-7381  
FAX (213) 482-9511

**BRENDA F. BARNETTE**  
GENERAL MANAGER

**TAMMY WATSON**  
ASSISTANT GENERAL MANAGER  
Administration

**MELISSA WEBBER**  
ASSISTANT GENERAL MANAGER  
Lifesaving

**DR. JEREMY PRUPAS**  
CHIEF VETERINARIAN

**Report to the Board of Animal Services Commissioners**

---

**MEETING DATE:** August 14, 2018

**PREPARED BY:** Brenda F Barnette

**REPORT DATE:** August 9, 2018

**TITLE:** General Manager

**SUBJECT: CALIFORNIA PROPOSITION 12, FARM ANIMAL CONFINEMENT INITIATIVE (2018)**

---

**BOARD ACTION RECOMMENDED: APPROVE**

Direct the Department to advise the City Council that the Board of Animal Services Commissioners supports the passage of Proposition 12 and to ask the City Lobbyists to **Support California Proposition 12, Farm Animal Confinement Initiative (2018)**.

***PLEASE NOTE: The content of this report has been taken directly from BALLOTPEdia, the online encyclopedia of American politics and elections. Their stated goal is to inform people about politics by providing accurate and objective information about politics at all levels of government. They are firmly committed to neutrality. To review their information in it's entirety on California Proposition 12, please click on this link:***

[https://ballotpedia.org/California Proposition 12, Farm Animal Confinement Initiative \(2018\)](https://ballotpedia.org/California Proposition 12, Farm Animal Confinement Initiative (2018))

**BACKGROUND:**

In 2008, the The Humane Society of the United States developed a ballot initiative, titled Proposition 2, to ban the confinement of pregnant pigs, calves raised for veal, and egg-laying hens in a manner that did not allow them to turn around freely, lie down, stand up, and fully extend their limbs. Proposition 2 did not provide specific square feet when defining prohibited confinement. Rather, the size restrictions were based on animal behavior. Opponents, such as the Association of California Egg Farmers, claimed this was too vague. Voters approved Proposition 2, and the law went into effect in 2015.

Proposition 12 of 2018, unlike Proposition 2, would ban the sale of meat and eggs from calves raised for veal, breeding pigs, and egg-laying hens confined in areas below a *specific number of square feet*. The size restrictions based on animal behavior would be repealed and replaced. Beginning in 2020, the proposal would ban:

- whole veal meat from a calf (young domestic cow) that was confined in an area with less than 43 square feet of usable floor space per calf;
- whole pork meat from a breeding pig or the immediate offspring of a breeding pig that was confined in an area with less than 24 square feet of usable floor space per pig; and
- shell eggs and liquid eggs from an egg-laying hen (chicken, turkey, duck, goose, or guinea fowl) that was confined in an area with less than 1 square foot of usable floor space per hen.

Beginning in 2021, producers would be required to confine egg-laying hens in cage-free housing systems based on the United Egg Producers' 2017 cage-free guidelines.

**California Proposition 12, the Farm Animal Confinement Initiative**, is on the ballot in California on November 6, 2018.

A **YES** vote supports banning the sale of meat and eggs from calves raised for veal, breeding pigs, and egg-laying hens confined in areas below a *specific number of square feet*.

A **NO** vote opposes banning the sale of meat and eggs from calves raised for veal, breeding pigs, and egg-laying hens confined in areas below a *specific number of square feet*.

The ballot initiative would make the California Department of Food and Agriculture and the California Department of Public Health responsible for the measure's implementation. Violations of the initiative would be considered misdemeanors, with fines up to \$1,000. Proposition 2 (2008) did not authorize a state department to enforce the ballot initiative. Therefore, local law enforcement agencies were made *de facto* responsible for enforcing Proposition 2's size restrictions

Prevent Cruelty California, a ballot measure committee, is leading the campaign in support of the ballot initiative. The Humane Society of the United States (HSUS) launched the campaign committee. As of July 7, 2018, the campaign committee had raised \$3.14 million. The largest contributor to the committee was the Humane Society, which provided \$2.05 million in cash and in-kind services.

The Association of California Egg Farmers and National Pork Producers Council came out in opposition to the ballot initiative, arguing that the required changes would increase food prices and create meat and egg shortages. The Humane Farming Association (HFA), People for the Ethical Treatment of Animals (PETA), and Friends of Animals—animal rights organizations—also came out against the initiative, contending that the HSUS was colluding with the United Egg Producers and that the measure would keep hens in "horrific multi-level "cage-free" factory systems." HFA launched the committee Californians Against Cruelty, Cages, and Fraud to oppose the initiative. As of July 7, 2018, the committee had raised \$550,000.

Bans sale of meat from animals confined in spaces below specific sizes.

#### **SUMMARY:**

The Humane Society of the United States, ASPCA, and nearly 500 California veterinarians endorse Prop 12.

Voting YES prevents baby veal calves, mother pigs, and egg-laying hens from being crammed inside tiny cages for their entire lives. It will eliminate inhumane and unsafe products from these abused animals from the California marketplace. Voting YES reduces the risk of people being sickened by food poisoning and factory farm pollution, and helps family farmers.

**PREVENT CRUELTY TO ANIMALS.** It's cruel to confine a baby calf in a tiny cage. Taken away from his mother shortly after birth, he's confined in that abusive way until he's sent to slaughter—at just four months old.

A mother pig shouldn't be locked in a tiny, metal cage where she can barely move. She's trapped, forced to live in this small amount of space for *nearly four years*.

It's wrong to cram a hen tightly in an overcrowded, wire cage for her entire life. She's forced to eat, sleep, defecate, waste, and lay eggs in the same small space every single day.

**PROTECT OUR FAMILIES FROM FOOD POISONING AND FACTORY FARM POLLUTION.** In the past decade, there have been recalls of nearly a billion eggs from caged chickens because they carried deadly *Salmonella*. Scientific studies repeatedly find that packing animals in tiny, filthy cages increases the risk of food poisoning. Even *Poultry World*, a leading egg industry publication admitted, "*Salmonella thrives in caged housing.*"

That's why the Center for Food Safety and National Consumers League both endorse YES on Prop 12.

The American Public Health Association called for a moratorium on new animal confinement operations because they pollute the air and ground water, and diminish the quality of life for nearby homeowners.

**HELP FAMILY FARMERS AND GROW THE CALIFORNIA ECONOMY.** Mega-factory farms that cage animals cut corners and drive family farmers out of business. By voting YES on Prop 12 we can create sensible standards that keep family farmers in business—and allow them to grow. Since cage-free farms employ more workers, this measure would create *more jobs* for hardworking farming families.

That's why *California family farmers* and the *United Farm Workers* endorse Prop 12.

#### A COMMON-SENSE REFORM

- Prop 12 strengthens a decade-old animal cruelty law and provides ample phase-in time for producers to shift to cage-free practices.
- Over 200 major food companies like *Walmart*, *Taco Bell*, *McDonald's*, *Burger King*, *Safeway*, and *Dollar Tree* have committed to using cage-free products.
- A dozen states have passed laws addressing the cruel caging of farm animals.
- The YES vote is endorsed by *Catholic*, *Presbyterian*, *Episcopal*, *Methodist*, *Jewish*, *Evangelical*, and *Unitarian* faith leaders, and *local animal shelters across California*.

We wouldn't force our dog or cat to live in a filthy, tiny cage for her whole life; we shouldn't allow any animal to endure such suffering either. All animals, including farm animals, deserve protection from cruelty and abuse.

#### SUPPORTERS

##### *Officials*

- Sen. Henry Stern (D-27)
- Former officials
- Sen. Dean Florez (D-16)

##### *Municipalities*

- Encinitas City Council

### *Organizations*

- The Humane Society of the United States
- The American Society for the Prevention of Cruelty to Animals
- San Francisco Society for the Prevention of Cruelty to Animals
- San Diego Humane Society
- Marin Humane Society
- Yolo County Society for the Prevention of Cruelty to Animals
- The Humane League
- Mercy For Animals
- Compassion in World Farming
- Animal Equality
- Animal Legal Defense Fund
- Animal Protection and Rescue League
- Compassion Over Killing
- FixNation
- Heaven on Earth Society for Animals
- In Defense of Animals
- Bark Avenue Foundation
- Compassion Champs
- Santa Paula Animal Rescue Inc.
- The Gentle Barn
- Animal Welfare Institute
- Harvest Home Animal Sanctuary
- The Humane Society Veterinary Medical Association
- Center for Food Safety
- Farm Forward
- National Consumers League
- Organic Consumers Association
- Center for Biological Diversity
- Roots of Change
- Jewish Initiative for Animals
- Evangelicals for Social Action
- CreatureKind
- Shamayim V'aretz Institute

### **ARGUMENTS**

- **Wayne Pacelle**, former president of the Humane Society, said, "Californians know that locking farm animals in tight cages for the duration of their lives is cruel and compromises food safety. All animals deserve humane treatment, especially those raised for food."

### **OPPONENTS**

- Association of California Egg Farmers
- Friends of Animals
- Humane Farming Association (HFA)
- National Pork Producers Council
- People for the Ethical Treatment of Animals (PETA)

**ARGUMENTS**

- The **Association of California Egg Farmers** issued the following statement: "With this new initiative now calling for full compliance by the end of 2021, HSUS is reneging on the original agreement and this expedited timeline may result in supply disruptions, price spikes and a shortage of eggs for sale."
- **Jim Monroe**, spokesperson of the National Pork Producers Council, said, "Livestock production practices should be left to those who are most informed about animal care — farmers — and not animal rights activists. Additionally, changes in housing systems, which come with significant costs that increase food prices, should be driven by consumer purchasing decisions, not the agenda of any activist group."
- The **Humane Farming Association** stated, "The Humane Society of the United States is once again deceiving voters, flip-flopping on the issue of cages, and perpetuating the suffering of millions of egg-laying hens throughout California. The inescapable reality is that, had Prop 2 actually accomplished what HSUS promised, California would be cage free at this very moment. Rather than correcting its historic failure, HSUS is now misusing our state's ballot measure process with a whole new set of false promises. This betrayal of voters and farm animals must be soundly defeated."

**FISCAL IMPACT:**

Potential decrease in state and local tax revenues from farm businesses, likely not to exceed the low millions of dollars annually. Potential state costs ranging up to ten million dollars annually to enforce the measure.

Approved:

  
Brenda Barnette, General Manager

---

**BOARD ACTION:**

<input checked="" type="checkbox"/>	Passed	<input type="checkbox"/>	Disapproved
<input type="checkbox"/>	Passed with noted modifications	<input type="checkbox"/>	Continued
<input type="checkbox"/>	Tabled	<input type="checkbox"/>	New Date