

Benjamin M. Reznik
Direct: (310) 201-3572
Fax: (310) 712-8572
bmr@jmbm.com

1900 Avenue of the Stars, 7th Floor
Los Angeles, California 90067-4308
(310) 203-8080 (310) 203-0567 Fax
www.jmbm.com

74521-0001

October 31, 2014

VIA E-MAIL AND PERSONAL DELIVERY

Honorable Jose Huizar, Chair
Honorable Gilbert Cedillo, Vice Chair
Honorable Mitchell Englander
Los Angeles City Council, Planning and Land Use Management Committee
200 North Spring Street, Room 395
Los Angeles, CA 90012
Attn: Sharon Gin, Legislative Assistant

Re: 1829 N. Kenmore Avenue
CF 14-1102; CHC-2014-2904-HCM
Hearing Date: November 4, 2014

Dear Members of the Planning and Land Use Management Committee:

We represent Kenmore Investments, LLC, the owner of the Bartlett House, located at 1829 N. Kenmore Avenue, (the Property) with respect to the City's review of the application for potential designation of the Property as a Historic-Cultural Monument. We request that the Planning and Land Use Management (PLUM) Committee of the City Council deny the application in conformance with the actions of the City's Cultural Heritage Commission that unanimously declined to designate the Property as historic.

On October 2, 2014, the Cultural Heritage Commission heard the application and determined that the Property does not fall under the criteria of Section 22.171.7 of the Los Angeles Administrative Code for designation of a Historic-Cultural Monument. The Office of Historic Resources provided a thorough historic analysis, including a site visit by the staff and commissioners. The staff report concluded that the Property does not convey the requisite specimen-quality characteristics of a Colonial Revival style residential structure, and is not a notable example of the master architect, A.C. Martin Sr., that created the design. As stated in the determination letter, the City Council may override the Commission's denial recommendation only by a minimum of ten (10) votes.

Councilmember Tom LaBonge introduced a motion on August 8, 2014, requesting that the Cultural Heritage Commission submit its report and recommendation to the City Council regarding the inclusion of the Property in the City's list of Historic-Cultural Monuments. This action has been accomplished by the Office of Historic Resources and the Cultural Heritage

Commission, who completed a thorough investigation and concluded that the house does not meet the thresholds for designation.


The Los Feliz Square Neighborhood Association also supports the denial of the designation. In their correspondence with the Office of Historic Resources, dated October 21, 2014, the Association confirmed that although they typically support historic preservation, they believed that this Property is poorly sited for preservation adjacent to multiple large apartment buildings and is better suited for development as a small lot subdivision.

Furthermore, this reconsideration of the historic eligibility of the Property is barred under the California Environmental Quality Act ("CEQA"). The Owner received project approvals from the City on November 8, 2013 to redevelop the Property as a small lot subdivision, which included adoption of a Mitigated Negative Declaration (MND) (VTTM 72296-SL, ZA-2013-1859-ZAA-SPP-SPPA, ENV-2013-1858-MND). The MND determined that further historical analysis was unnecessary, based on concurrence from the Office of Historic Resources. The approval was not appealed, and there was no challenge to the project under CEQA within the statute of limitations. The City is prohibited from now reconsidering claims not timely brought through any administrative or judicial action.

The Owner has acted in reliance on the City's approvals, including spending hundreds of thousands of dollars on design, construction documents and financing since the expiration of the appeal period. The City has already issued building permits for the project, and the Owner is ready to pull the demolition permit and commence construction. Any action to rescind these approvals and designate the building as historic would subject the City to significant liability.

We request that the City follow the historic analysis of the Office of Historic Resources and the determination of the Cultural Heritage Commission and deny the application for designation.

Sincerely,



BENJAMIN M. REZNIK
SHERI BONSTELLE of
Jeffer Mangels Butler & Mitchell LLP

Enclosure

BMR:slb

cc: Mayor Eric Garcetti
Councilmember Tom LaBonge
Renee Weitzer, Chief of Land Use Planning, CD4
Terry Kaufman-Macias, Deputy City Attorney
Ken Bernstein, Office of Historic Resources
Lambert Giessinger, Office of Historic Resources

DEPARTMENT OF
CITY PLANNING

OFFICE OF HISTORIC RESOURCES
200 N. SPRING STREET, ROOM 620
LOS ANGELES, CA 90012-4801
(213) 978-1200

CULTURAL HERITAGE COMMISSION

RICHARD BARRON
PRESIDENT

JEREMY IRVINE
GAIL KENNARD
BARRY A. MILOFSKY
ELISSA SCRAFANO

FEY C. PINGOL
COMMISSION EXECUTIVE ASSISTANT
(213) 978-1300

CITY OF LOS ANGELES
CALIFORNIA



ERIC GARCETTI
MAYOR

EXECUTIVE OFFICES

MICHAEL LOGRANDE
DIRECTOR
(213) 978-1271

ALAN BELL, AICP
DEPUTY DIRECTOR
(213) 978-1272

LISA WEBBER, AICP
DEPUTY DIRECTOR
(213) 978-1274

JAN ZATORSKI
DEPUTY DIRECTOR
(213) 978-1273

FAX: (213) 978-1275

INFORMATION
(213) 978-1270

www.planning.lacity.org

Date: **OCT 17 2014**

Los Angeles City Council
Room 395, City Hall
200 North Spring Street
Los Angeles, California 90012

Attention: Sharon Gin, Legislative Assistant
Planning and Land Use Management Committee

CASE NUMBER: **CHC-2014-2904-HCM; CF 14-1102**
BARTLETT RESIDENCE
1829 N. KENMORE AVENUE

This is to advise you that at its meeting of **October 2, 2014**, the Cultural Heritage Commission discussed the application for the above-mentioned property for possible declaration as an Historic-Cultural Monument.

The consensus of the Commission is that this property does not fall under the criteria in Section 22.171.7 of the Los Angeles Administrative Code. Therefore, the request has been declined.

The City Council, according to the guidelines set forth in Section 22.171.10 of the Los Angeles Administrative Code, shall act on the proposed inclusion to the list within 90 days of the Council or Commission action, whichever first occurs. By resolution, the Council may extend the period for good cause for an additional 15 days. The City Council may override a Commission recommendation of denial of a Council-initiated designation by a minimum of ten (10) votes.

The above Cultural Heritage Commission action was taken by the following vote:

Moved: Commissioner Irvine
Seconded: Commissioner Milofsky
Ayes: Commissioners Scrafano and Barron
Absent: Commissioner Kennard

Vote: **4-0**


Fey C. Pingol, Commission Executive Assistant
Cultural Heritage Commission

c: Councilmember Tom LaBonge, Fourth Council District
Bill Zide
Charles J. Fisher
GIS

**DEPARTMENT OF
CITY PLANNING**

OFFICE OF HISTORIC RESOURCES
200 N. SPRING STREET, ROOM 620
LOS ANGELES, CA 90012-4801
(213) 978-1200

CULTURAL HERITAGE COMMISSION

RICHARD BARRON
PRESIDENT

JEREMY IRVINE
GAIL KENNARD
BARRY A. MILOFSKY
ELISSA SCRAFANO

FELY C. PINGOL
COMMISSION EXECUTIVE ASSISTANT
(213) 978-1300

CITY OF LOS ANGELES
CALIFORNIA



ERIC GARCETTI
MAYOR

EXECUTIVE OFFICES

MICHAEL LOGRANDE
DIRECTOR
(213) 978-1271

ALAN BELL, AICP
DEPUTY DIRECTOR
(213) 978-1272

LISA WEBBER, AICP
DEPUTY DIRECTOR
(213) 978-1274

JAN ZATORSKI
DEPUTY DIRECTOR
(213) 978-1273

FAX: (213) 978-1275

INFORMATION
(213) 978-1270

www.planning.lacity.org

Date: **OCT 10 2014**

Kenmore Investments, LLC
12324 Montana Street, Suite 1
Los Angeles, CA 90048

CASE NUMBER: CHC-2014-2904-HCM
BARTLETT RESIDENCE
1829 N. KENMORE AVENUE

This is to advise you that at its meeting of **October 2, 2014**, the Cultural Heritage Commission discussed the application for the above-mentioned property for possible declaration as an Historic-Cultural Monument.

The consensus of the Commission is that this property does not fall under the criteria in Section 22.171.7 of the Los Angeles Administrative Code. Therefore, the request has been declined.

In accordance with the City Charter Section 245, actions of the Cultural Heritage Commission shall become final at the expiration of the next five meeting days of the Los Angeles City Council during which the Council has convened in regular session.

The above Cultural Heritage Commission action was taken by the following vote:

Moved: Commissioner Irvine
Seconded: Commissioner Milofsky
Ayes: Commissioners Scrafano and Barron
Absent: Commissioner Kennard

Vote: 4-0



Fely C. Pingol, Commission Executive Assistant
Cultural Heritage Commission

c: Councilmember Tom LaBonge, Fourth Council District
Bill Zide
Charles J. Fisher
GIS

**Los Angeles Department of City Planning
RECOMMENDATION REPORT**

CULTURAL HERITAGE COMMISSION

**CASE NO.: CHC-2014-2904-HCM
ENV-2014-2905-CE**

HEARING DATE: October 2, 2014
TIME: 10:00 AM
PLACE: City Hall, Room 1010
200 N. Spring Street
Los Angeles, CA
90012

Location: 1829 N. Kenmore Avenue
Council District: 4
Community Plan Area: Hollywood
Area Planning Commission: Central
Neighborhood Council: Los Feliz
Legal Description: Lot 53, BLK E of the Hombly
Avenue Tract No. 3

PROJECT: Historic-Cultural Monument Application for the
BARTLETT RESIDENCE

REQUEST: Declare the property a Historic-Cultural Monument

OWNER: Kenmore Investments, LLC
12324 Montana Street, Suite 1
Los Angeles, CA 90049

APPLICANT: Bill Zide
1750 N. Serrano Avenue
Los Angeles, CA 90027

**APPLICANT
REPRESENTATIVE:** Charles J. Fisher
140 S. Avenue 57
Los Angeles, CA 90042

RECOMMENDATION That the Cultural Heritage Commission:

1. Do not declare the property a Historic-Cultural Monument per Los Angeles Administrative Code Chapter 9, Division 22, Article 1, Section 22.171.7.
2. Adopt the staff report and findings.

MICHAEL J. LOGRANDE
Director of Planning

[SIGNED ORIGINAL IN FILE]

Ken Bernstein, AICP, Manager
Office of Historic Resources

[SIGNED ORIGINAL IN FILE]

Lambert M. Giessinger, Preservation Architect
Office of Historic Resources

Attachments: Historic-Cultural Monument Application

FINDINGS

- The building does not "[embody] the distinguishing characteristics of an architectural type specimen, inherently valuable for a study of a period style or method of construction" as an example of the residential Colonial Revival style.
- The building is not "a notable example of a master architect" as an example of a house designed by A.C. Martin, Sr.

CRITERIA

The criterion is the Cultural Heritage Ordinance which defines a historical or cultural monument as any site (including significant trees or other plant life located thereon) building or structure of particular historic or cultural significance to the City of Los Angeles, such as historic structures or sites in which the broad cultural, economic, or social history of the nation, State or community is reflected or exemplified, or which are identified with historic personages or with important events in the main currents of national, State or local history or which embody the distinguishing characteristics of an architectural type specimen, inherently valuable for a study of a period style or method of construction, or a notable work of a master builder, designer or architect whose individual genius influenced his age.

SUMMARY

This American Colonial Revival style single-family residence was built in 1914. It is a two-story structure with a gabled roof and an eyebrow roof form over the entrance to the house. The exterior materials are wood shingles on the second floor and horizontal boards on the first floor. Rafter tails are visible along the eave-ends of the gable. The second floor is garrisoned and has a protruding belt course around the house. The wood shingles at the garrison visually create a slight upward curve. The exterior of the house is painted white with the screens on the windows painted green. The asphalt shingles on the roof are also of a shade of green. The entrance to the house is off-center and is shaped by a porch with full-height Tuscan columns that support a wooden pergola. Above the pergola is a balconette that runs beneath two small windows on the second floor. Three rounded, wooden brackets support it. A chimney is visible protruding from the north gable-end. Windows are double-hung with six lights in the upper sashes and a single light in the lower sashes. The interior features include hardwood floors, paneled wainscoting, multi-light glass and wood pocket doors, original kitchen, wrought iron banister on the upper stairs and a wooden fireplace mantel.

The house was designed by Albert Carey Martin, Sr. and is one of few remaining single-family residences from his firm. His firm served as architect for many significant buildings in the Los Angeles area, including St. Vincent de Paul Church (HCM #90), Million Dollar Theatre (Listed in National Register), Ventura County Courthouse (Listed in National Register), Higgins Building (HCM #873), Wilshire May Company (HCM #566), Los Angeles City Hall (HCM #150). Martin founded the architectural firm of AC Martin & Associates in 1906 and it remains in business today.

DISCUSSION

The Bartlett Residence does not successfully meet either of the two specific Historic-Cultural Monument criteria that the property was nominated under: 1) "embodies the distinguishing characteristics of an architectural type specimen, inherently valuable for a study of a period style or method of construction," and 2) "notable work of a master architect." The Bartlett Residence

was designed in the Colonial Revival style with Arts and Crafts influences. Although the property features prominent architectural features, such as an eyebrow roof-form, Tuscan columns, multi-lite hung windows, wood-shingle façade, pocket doors and wainscoting, the property does not convey the requisite specimen-quality characteristics of a Colonial Revival style residential structure.

Also, the house is not a notable example of the master architect that created the design. A.C. Martin, Sr. is considered a master architect for his contribution to the commercial, industrial, institutional and ecclesiastical designs that have become iconic structures in Los Angeles. However, in order to be a designated HCM, a structure must not only be designed by a master architect, but also be a notable example of their work. In the case of the Bartlett Residence the architecture itself is not particularly notable, the commission to design the house did not further Martin's architectural career, and the design of the subject property did not precede any major works that built upon the concepts utilized in its construction. The fact that Martin did not design many residential structures does not automatically elevate this property to a "notable" level of design. In contrast to the Bartlett Residence is the C.C. Ganahl House, also designed by Martin, a single-family home from 1913 that was designated as HCM #1012 in 2012. The Prairie style architecture of the C.C. Ganahl House is considered an excellent example of the style, whereas the Bartlett Residence is not considered an excellent example of the Colonial Revival style. The finish and workmanship of the C.C. Ganahl House is overall of a higher quality than the Bartlett Residence; this is especially true of the interior. Where the interior of the Bartlett Residence is relatively modest in appointment and materials, the C.C. Ganahl House has such features as dentiled crown moldings, a coved ceiling with oak ceiling panels, a large, floor-to-ceiling Batchelder tile fireplace, and intact custom carved-oak cabinetry in the living and dining rooms.

BACKGROUND

On August 7th, 2014, the Office of Historic Resources received an application for Historic-Cultural Monument status for the subject property from the applicant listed on this report. On August 8th, 2014, a motion was introduced at City Council by Councilmember Tom LaBonge, and seconded by Councilmember Gilbert Cedillo, to initiate consideration of the subject property by instructing the Planning Department to prepare an Historic-Cultural Monument application. On August 21st, 2014 the Cultural Heritage Commission considered taking the property under consideration, but postponed any decision pending the outcome of the Council motion. On September 10th, the motion to nominate the property was approved by City Council. On September 18th, Commissioners Barron and Milofsky inspected the site with Lambert Giessinger of the Office of Historic Resources (OHR) staff. Later on September 18th, 2014, Commissioners Irvine and Kennard inspected the site with Nels Youngborg of the OHR staff. And later in the day Commissioner Scrafano inspected the site with Tim Rosenstein of the OHR staff.